

DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 049 398

AA 000 693

AUTHOR Ohliger, John; McCarthy, Colleen
 TITLE Lifelong Learning or Lifelong Schooling? A Tentative View of the Ideas of Ivan Illich with a Quotational Bibliography.
 INSTITUTION Syracuse Univ., N.Y. ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult Education.; Syracuse Univ., N.Y. Publications Program in Continuing Education.
 PUB DATE Jul 71
 NOTE 102p.
 AVAILABLE FROM Publications in Continuing Education, 105 Roney Lane, Syracuse, N.Y. 13210 (\$1.50)
 EDRS PRICE EDRS Price MF-\$0.65 HC-\$6.58
 DESCRIPTORS *Adult Education, *Adult Educators, Annotated Bibliographies, *Continuous Learning, Developing Nations, Educational Innovation, *Educational Philosophy, Educational Problems, Literacy Education, Opinions, Organizations (Groups)
 IDENTIFIERS Center for Intercultural Documentation, Freire (Paulo), *Illich (Ivan)

ABSTRACT

Recent writings on the life and thought of Ivan Illich are summarized in this paper. Attention is focused on his missionary training activities, his subsequent involvement with the Center for Intercultural Documentation in Cuernavaca, Mexico, and the influence of a Brazilian adult educator, Paulo Freire, on Illich's social and educational thinking. Finally, Illich's own views on public education and the learning process are set forth. He calls for the abolition of compulsory schooling in view of what he considers the idolatrous worship of formal education and certification, and the institutional failures of education, around the world. Illich also urges that the drift of adult education toward institutional status be reversed to help make way for informal educational networks based on mutual inquiry and on lifelong access to educational opportunities of one's own choosing. Included are 157 references. (LY)

LIFELONG LEARNING OR LIFELONG SCHOOLING?

A TENTATIVE VIEW OF THE IDEAS OF IVAN ILICH

WITH A QUOTATIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHY

by

JOHN OHLIGER

Associate Professor of Adult Education

The Ohio State University

and

COLLEEN MC CARTHY

Syracuse University

PUBLICATIONS IN CONTINUING EDUCATION

AND

ERIC CLEARINGHOUSE ON ADULT EDUCATION



CLEARINGHOUSE ON ADULT EDUCATION

107 RONEY LANE | SYRACUSE, NEW YORK 13210

SPONSORED BY SYRACUSE UNIVERSITY AND THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER OF
THE U. S. OFFICE OF EDUCATION

Stanley M. Grabowski / Acting Director

This publication was prepared pursuant to a contract with the Office of Education, U.S. Department of Health, Education and Welfare. Contractors undertaking such projects under Government sponsorship are encouraged to express freely their judgment in professional and technical matters. Points of view or opinions do not, therefore, necessarily represent official Office of Education position or policy.

OCCASIONAL PAPERS

A special series devoted to documents which, though prepared in a specific context and for a limited audience, are judged to be of such general interest that they merit wider distribution than that for which they were originally intended. They are presented in the hope that they will contribute to the more general sharing of information and opinion about questions of importance in the field of adult education.

This Occasional Paper may be secured for \$1.50 per copy by writing to:

Publications in Continuing Education
105 Roney Lane
Syracuse, New York 13210

LIBRARY OF CONGRESS CATALOGUE CARD

Syracuse University Publications
in Continuing Education

ISBN Number: 0-87060-044-3

ABSTRACT

Recent writings on the life and thought of Ivan Illich are summarized in this paper. Attention is focused on his missionary training activities, his subsequent involvement with the Center for Intercultural Documentation in Cuernavaca, Mexico, and the influence of a Brazilian adult educator, Paulo Freire, on Illich's social and educational thinking. Finally, Illich's own views on public education and the learning process are set forth. He calls for the abolition of compulsory schooling in view of what he considers the idolatrous worship of formal education and certification, and the institutional failures of education, around the world. Illich also urges that the drift of adult education toward institutional status be reversed to help make way for informal educational networks based on mutual inquiry and on lifelong access to educational opportunities of one's own choosing. Included are 157 references.

May 1971

FOREWARD

Society is changing rapidly in many ways, while our system of education is changing very slowly. The current crises call for critical changes, challenging all of us to our utmost capacities. Most of us, however, are somewhat slow and hesitant to stand back and look with a dispassionate eye at the philosophy, institutional arrangements, methods, and techniques accepted by the system and honored through long usage.

Ivan Illich is ceremoniously debunking many "sacred cows" in education. He is a radical and a revolutionary in the etymological sense of these words: a radical because he goes to the roots and foundations of issues; a revolutionary because he is trying to turn things right-side-up.

Adult educators -- for too long looked upon by many as being engaged in peripheral and ephemeral educational activities -- will be particularly pleased as they study, with concerned interest, the implications of lifelong learning as preached by Illich.

All of us are grateful and indebted to Dr. John Ohliger and Ms Colleen McCarthy for sharing with a wider audience this review of the literature by and about Ivan Illich and his thinking regarding lifelong learning. This review is based on the bibliography originally developed by Dr. Ohliger for his adult education seminar at the Ohio State University.

Also, we are grateful to the Syracuse University Publications in Continuing Education program for making this publication widely available.

Stanley M. Grabowski,
Acting Director,
ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult Education.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	<u>PAGE</u>
Introduction	1
The Man	2
His Ideas	9
Transition to Bibliography	17
Quotational Bibliography	20

Introduction

"I want to live in mutual education up to the moment, and in the moment, of my death," says Ivan Illich (40).^{*} Who is this man who is the subject of such growing national and international attention? To name only some of the most widely attended sources, in recent years he has been the subject of two articles in Time magazine (1, 10), four articles in the New York Times (6, 11, 12, 20), four articles by or about him in Saturday Review (8, 26, 36, 61), a profile in the New Yorker magazine (22), and the full treatment in Current Biography (51). In the past six months he has appeared on a number of national T.V. programs, including "The Today Show" and "The Dick Cavett Show." In February, 1971, he spoke at the national convention of the American Educational Research Association (44). And he has been invited to deliver a major address to the joint convention of the National Association for Public Continuing Adult Education and the Adult Education Association in Los Angeles this November.

Why has Illich been the subject of so much controversy in both educational and religious circles? Probably the youngest monsignor in the history of the Roman Catholic Church in this country, he has been called "one of the Church's most original and outspoken innovators (and) most valuable figures (2)." Yet in 1969 he felt it

^{*} Numbers in parentheses refer to items in the bibliography beginning on page 20.

necessary to "irrevocably" resign from his priestly functions (53). Newsweek for May 3, 1971 states: "In a forthcoming book, De-Schooling Society (48), Illich, an ebullient Catholic priest, will argue quite seriously the mind-boggling proposition that the United States should abolish compulsory education and replace it with a system geared to individual initiative. Most Americans, of course, are simply not prepared to accept solutions so contrary to their fundamental beliefs."

What implications for adult education do the ideas of this man have, who was recently quoted in the Saturday Review as saying, "Education of adults which is analytical and dialectic leads inevitably to a liberation from taboos....Real adult education is far more radical than training guerrillas (61)"?

What follows is our attempt to pose possible answers to these questions. We call this essay "a tentative view" because we are in a fluid process of interpreting the meanings of his ideas for both our personal and work lives.

The Man

Ivan Illich "is a kind of ultimate figure, a symbol of the controversies that rock modern man, yet somehow (go) beyond them. In an earlier age, Illich might have become a mythical figure - a religious schismatic or a political criminal marked for exile or execution (5)." The intrigue, dynamism, and versatility which characterize Illich today are reflective of a life momentum which embraces incessant surprise, change, and growth.

Illich was born in 1926 in Vienna of a Croation Catholic

father, a wealthy engineer and landowner in prewar Germany, and a Sephardic Jewish mother whose family had moved to Germany from Spain. During the thirties he was expelled from an Austrian school because of his mother's Jewish heritage. He then continued his education in Italy, later doing research in crystallography at the University of Florence. By the age of twenty-four he had earned, in addition to a doctorate in history from Salzburg University (his dissertation topic was Toynbee's philosophy of history), degrees in philosophy and theology from the Vatican's prestigious Gregorian University.

Shortly after his ordination in Rome, Illich turned down the opportunity to pursue further studies at the Collegio di Nobili Ecclesiastici "where gifted linguists and intellectuals are prepared for high-ranking careers in the Church's diplomatic corps (22)." He chose instead to accept an obscure parish position in an Irish sector of New York City that had been experiencing an influx of Puerto Rican immigrants. One of his first assignments was to learn Spanish (he now speaks eleven languages fluently and reads fifteen). At the close of three weeks' attendance at Berlitz classes and of standing on street corners talking with parishioners, he was conversing fluently.

After learning Spanish, he immediately plunged into a round of adult education activities, including community development. It was said of him that: "In New York his ability to recruit people was nothing short of extraordinary. He started employment agencies for Puerto Rican migrants and persuaded Madison Avenue magnates to pub-

licize them....He encouraged young social workers to live in cuartitos - small apartments in the Puerto Rican slums - so that they could better observe the needs of the people. 'The Puerto Ricans idolized him,' (a former colleague) Father Connolly has said. 'He was Mr. Puerto Rico, their Babe Ruth (22).' "

A few months after staging the first national feast day for Puerto Ricans in New York, San Juan Day, a gala fiesta drawing together an ecstatic crowd of thirty-five thousand people at the Fordham quadrangle, the late Frances Cardinal Spellman (who remained loyal to him until his death) sent Illich to Puerto Rico to start an adult education Institute of Intercultural Communications. Its purpose was to steep priests from the United States in Latin American culture and to provide them with intensive language training, so that they might work more effectively with the immigrants in New York.

At Ponce, Puerto Rico, Illich fought a bitter battle in an attempt to introduce adult education into the local university (47). While on the island he was vice-chancellor of the Catholic university and was a member of the Commonwealth's five-man Board of Education.

In 1960 Illich protested the political intervention of Puerto Rico's Bishop James McManus, who tried to forbid Catholics to vote for Governor Luis Monoz Marin because of the birth control issue. As a result, Illich was ordered to leave his Ponce parish position. With Spellman easing the move, he then returned to New York, where he accepted a faculty appointment at Fordham.

Still intensely concerned with the problems of training missionaries for Latin America, Illich gained support from Fordham University and the Bishops' Committee on Latin America in 1961 to open the Center of Intercultural Formation at Cuernavaca, Mexico (now called the Center for Intercultural Documentation - CIDOC). The "center for de-Yankeefication," part language school, part conference center, part free university, part publishing house - was designed not so much to train missionaries as to keep all but the most progressive of them away (22). It was at CIDOC in the late 1960's that Illich first developed his proposals for the disestablishment of schools.

About the center, which is a place of intense adult education activity, Illich says: "We want to keep CIDOC a free island, an oasis for the free exchange of knowledge and experience. The only rules we hold are: one, you may talk ten minutes without being interrupted; two, do not try to proselytize or brainwash; three, do not organize any direct political, economic, or social action - not even religious movements. CIDOC is in the deepest sense a contemplative place, not a conspiratorial place....(22)."

Illich maintains a deep commitment to adult education. Obsessed with the problems which beset both so-called "underdeveloped" and highly technological nations, he persisted in keeping the Center open even after he had been charged by the Vatican with heretical activities. However, since the time that Catholic religious were temporarily banned from the Center by the Vatican, CIDOC has increasingly devoted its attention to broader educational issues

and to weighty societal problems. Illich, with his characteristic exuberance, says: "I would like to help people smile - smile the social system apart....Here at CIDOC we smile violence apart. It is a place where violent people can come and learn respeto para la vida (respect for life). Real revolutionaries are men who look with a deep sense of humor - with sarcasm - upon their institutions. Sarcasm is adult playfulness. Cynicism is its opposite. Instead of freedom and independence, cynicism produces not real revolution but a regressive attachment to slogans and self worship. For deadly serious revolutionaries - non, merci. But sarcasm is essential, to purify us of our illusions (22)."

Illich is the author of three books: Celebration of Awareness: A Call for Institutional Revolution (38), The Church, Change and Development (39), and De-Schooling Society (48), which is to be published in spring, 1971, and of many articles (23-37, 41-43, 45). In addition to his current activities at CIDOC he is a member of the International Dialogue Committee at the Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions in Santa Barbara, California. (For more biographical information on Illich see 22, 51, 61.)

It is impossible to discuss Illich without indicating at least two of his many colleagues who have strongly influenced his thought.

Illich credits his interest in public education to Everett Reimer. The two men met in 1956 in Puerto Rico where Reimer was secretary of the Committee on Human Resources of the Commonwealth government to assess manpower needs there and to develop an educational program to meet those needs. Reimer has also been an advisor

to the first coordinator of the U.S. Alliance for Progress and has acted as a consultant to various institutions, including Syracuse University. Reimer and Illich have been in conversation on educational and broad social topics for the past fifteen years and in semi-formal collaboration at CIDOC since 1968. Though they work closely together in joint research, they have decided to publish their views separately. Reimer's essay on Alternatives in Education has gone through several drafts. A book presenting his thoughts on education and society will be published this fall by Doubleday and Company (59). (For works by Reimer see 57, 58, 59.)

A second colleague, Paulo Freire, is regarded by Reimer as the greatest living educator in the world today; Illich calls Freire "my master and my teacher (49)." Freire is known in Latin America for his brilliantly successful work in adult literacy education. His methodology has been used extensively in literacy campaigns throughout northeastern Brazil and in Chile, where he worked five years with adult education programs for the Chilean Institute for Agrarian Reform and with UNESCO.

In Brazil, his native land, where he held a high position in public education, Freire "discovered that any adult can begin to read in a matter of forty hours if the first words he deciphers are charged with political meaning. Freire trains his teachers to move into a village and to discover the words which designate current important issues, such as the access to a well or the compound interest on the debts owed to the patron. In the evening the villagers meet for discussion of these key words. They begin to realize that each word stays on the blackboard even after its sound has

faded. The letters continue to unlock reality and to make it manageable as a problem. (The) discussants grow in social awareness and are impelled to take political action as fast as they learn to read (33)." How reminiscent this is of Eduard Lindeman's conviction that true adult education activity necessarily results in social action.

Reimer observes Freire "found in working with Brazilian peasants that they immediately learned to read those words which helped them to discover their true life situation. Discovering this vocabulary requires an insight into the lives of these peasants which penetrates the secrets, misinformation, and mystification with which their land-lords, priests, and political leaders surround them. Paulo Freire's clients no sooner learned to read than they organized peasant leagues through which they tried to bargain with their employers. Although they were scrupulously careful to observe the law and the customs of the region, their employers, government authorities, and the Church turned upon them in unison. Their leaders were fired and jailed, and the Church denied its sacraments to members of the league until Protestant missionaries began to make converts among them (59)."

Consequent to the implementation of his pedagogy in Brazil, Freire was thrown in jail by the military junta and then expelled from his country. He has remained in political exile since the 1964 coup. Not finding leeway to work freely in Chile, he traveled to the United States to act as a consultant with the Harvard School of Education. He is currently with the educational division of the World Council of Churches in Geneva where he, according to Reimer,

is "safely and unhappily insulated from the poor and uneducated masses of the world (59)." (For material by or about Freire see 16-19, 54.)

His Ideas

We were first attracted to Illich's ideas when we made the refreshing discovery that here was a brilliant man who wrote intensively, naturally, without cant or cliché of his strong concern for adult education. What a contrast this was to the drivel about adult education we have so often encountered. After reading and discussing as many of the writings of Illich and his colleagues as we could lay our hands on, we have come to the conclusion that the essence of his thoughts on education and society could be, but should not be, reduced to a single statement.

Illich, we think, is basically saying: Honor the first Commandment - "You shall have no other Gods before me." The nub of his criticism appears to reflect his belief that the nations of the world have created another God in the school system. If, as the best of Judeo-Christian theology propounds, God is the God of Freedom, then the worship of a god substitute, like the school, will necessarily make us slaves (90).

But we conclude that Illich has not reduced his thoughts to such a simple sentence because if he merely got up and made this statement, people would comment, "That's nice," and would forget all about it. He does say, however: "Many students....intuitively know what the schools do for them. They school them to confuse process with substance. Once these become blurred, a new logic is assumed: the more treatment there is the better are the results:

or, escalation leads to success. The pupil is thereby 'schooled' to confuse teaching with learning, grade advancement with education, a diploma with competence, and fluency with the ability to say something new....School appropriates the money, men, and good will available for education and in addition discourages other institutions from assuming educational tasks....The paradox of the schools is evident: increased expenditure escalates their destructiveness at home and abroad....Equal educational opportunity is, indeed, both a desirable and a feasible goal, but to equate this with.... schooling is to confuse salvation with the Church. School has become the world religion of a modernized proletariat (33)." Is it any wonder that some young people, who are beginning to recognize what schools do to them, are saying, "You're all schooled up!" or, "School you!"

What has all this to do with adult education? Two things. First, adult education is, by and large, geared into the mechanism of the school system. Second, and more important, the essential constraints of the school system are progressively encroaching on adult education. As Illich says, "The school-leaving age in developed nations outpaces the rise in life expectancy. The two curves will intersect in a decade and create a problem for Jessica Mitford and professionals concerned with 'terminal education.'.... The totally destructive and constantly progressive nature of obligatory instruction will fulfill its ultimate logic unless we begin to liberate ourselves right now from our pedagogical hubris, our belief that men can do what God cannot, namely manipulate others for their own salvation (41)."

Not only is Illich seriously concerned with the harmful effects of schooling phenomena on adult education, but he goes much further to declare that all of education should be conceived of "as an exercise in adulthood (26)." In part, he calls for this approach because of his conclusion (based on 66) that childhood is simply an invention of the industrial age to rationalize the "necessity" of schooling for the young. What Illich is saying, in other words, is that schools perpetuate the myth that a human being is not ready for full recognition as a person until he has undergone a lengthy period of treatment known as schooling. To view schooling as treatment presumes that learning is the process of classifying information. Thus the authoritarian teacher who alleges he holds the "secrets" of the classification system transfers not only the system but its bits of information into the heads of his pupils. This is what Illich's mentor Freire refers to as the nutritive, digestive, or banking theory of learning (19). Similarly a few adult educators have criticized this teaching-learning view. Roby Kidd calls it "the hole in the head theory of learning."

But Illich has gone beyond others in posing a valuably different theory of learning and in vigorously exploring the implications of that theory for the institutions of education. For this purpose, he calls our attention to a Hebrew word for "to know" which may be literally translated as "penetrating to the very nakedness of reality." As Freire points out, this notion involves a critical examination of reality. Freire calls this the "problem-posing" approach as opposed to the "problem-solving" approach which is still tied to the classification of information. Rather than viewing the

schooling-learning process in the traditional way, which is to say that education is the transmittal of knowledge, Illich believes that valuable learning occurs only when the individual makes a self-motivated personal decision to engage in mutual interchange with reality. To facilitate this approach to learning Illich concludes we must disestablish the school system and nurture in its place a series of informal educational networks: things, skill models, peers, and elders. (For a more detailed description of Illich's alternative suggestions see 42 or 48.)

In concrete terms Illich - and Reimer - are propounding that financial resources for learning be placed in the hands of the individual through some kind of entitlement plan. Illich and Reimer even suggest that these entitlements be interest bearing so that many adults would have larger resources available to them than youth. They assume that the individual would make the best choices, if he were not hampered by state or industry-imposed certification requirements, given the existence of an "educational free market (57)," and protected by anti-monopoly laws.

It is this concept of the "educational free market" that we have the most difficulty in accepting. We endorse wholeheartedly Illich's attacks on what Gouldner calls "the bureaucratic vampire (99)" - the bureaucratic hideousness of schooling institutions. But we are equally apprehensive about the dangers of "the commercial vampire." One of the bases on which Illich and Reimer oppose schools is that they package learning into a commodity as the inculcator of the consumer society. But it is difficult to see how turning over education, even in a modified way, to the tender mercies of the mar-

ket would not result in the same packaged commodity approach. Our personal experiences with adult educators as entrepreneurs in our field increases our fears of the market mechanism. Nevertheless, we sense that Illich is calling for a market that would be much more under the control of the buyer, a market in which the emphasis would be on a genuine interchange between the buyer and the seller. It is clear that such an emphasis would be possible only in a revolutionarily changed society. Illich, Reimer, and Freire make no bones about the need for such radical social change.

However, we still believe that better mechanisms than that of any form of the market will have to be developed. What those mechanisms will be we don't know. But we share with Illich the belief that we must "risk the future on the educability of man (32)." Illich maintains that man is educable because he is creative (47). We have no doubt that the creativity of some men will result in developing more appropriate frameworks in which to operate alternative modes to institutional schooling.

Illich's confirmed faith in the fundamental educability of man may make him appear an exaggerated optimist. He is an optimist and he isn't. He certainly espouses a hope in man's potential to grow, but he also senses a possibility that man may be headed toward a far darker future, a far more horrible world than the one the present school system and the consumer society are jointly responsible for. It is in recognition of this possibility that his words should ring out loud and clear to adult educators.

On the one hand, his call for us to recognize the institutional failures of the school offers a great opportunity. We share the view

that even though adult education is too often a part of the schooling establishment, to the extent that we have maintained freedom from schooling constraints we may be the forerunners of new worldwide pluralistic forms of humanistic educational networks - a true world of lifelong learning, a learning or educative society in the best sense.

On the other hand, Illich warns us that we could become the bellweather of a system far worse than we have now. As the universal compulsory system is disestablished because of growing disenchantment with its perpetuation of inequality, its astronomically rising costs, and its basic anti-educational effect, it could be replaced by a ghastly structure through which the whole world becomes a school. Illich pointed his finger straight at the adult education "establishment" when he said at the American Educational Research Association convention in New York in February of this year: "At some time during the last two generations a commitment to therapy triumphed whose ministrations all men need, if they wish to enjoy the equality and freedom with which, according to the constitution, they are born. Now the teacher therapists go on to propose lifelong educational treatment as the next step. The style of this treatment is under discussion: Should it take the form of continued adult classroom attendance? Electronic ecstasy? Or periodic sensitivity sessions? All educators are ready to conspire to push out the walls of the classroom with the goal of transforming the entire culture into a school (44)."

We believe that the opportunity and the warning Illich brings us implies at least three tentative proposals for action by adult

educators. First, we must oppose all trends toward imbedding adult education further into the structure of the schooling establishment. This means laughing out of the ballpark the drift toward the packaged treatment mode as seen in recent U.S. Office of Education and Corporation for Public Broadcasting proposals for an "adult Sesame Street." This means applying well-deserved sarcasm to attempts to smother adults with certification mania as seen in moves for massive granting of high-school equivalency diplomas through classes aimed at helping adults pass the General Educational Development (G.E.D.) test. The same sarcasm should be applied to those college administrators who would develop more "adult degree" programs. This means snickering into submission those who would extend into adulthood the concept of age-specific curricula by trying to develop programs based on Havighurst's developmental tasks. This means applying the hee-haw and then the heave-ho to the growing trend toward extending the compulsory principle to adult education. (For more on this see 122, 127, 128, 129.) This means recognizing how fatuous are proposals for bribery or seduction (e.g., schemes to "motivate" adults to attend classes) as a substitute for compulsion in adult education. (For one example of this see 74).

Second, we should take a lesson from history and begin organizing adult education groups to help bring about the de-schooling of society. Knowles points out in his book The Adult Education Movement in the United States (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, Inc., 1962) that one of the shining stars in the history of American adult education, the Lyceum movement, "was one of the most powerful instruments of its time for the mobilization of public

opinion in favor of tax-supported schools." He quotes Cecil B. Hayes, an historian of the Lyceum movement, as indicating that Lyceum groups made one of their main purposes "advancing the cause of the public schools." What greater service could adult educators perform today but to organize local study groups similar to those of the Lyceum, to bring about the disestablishment of the public school in the name of manifold equal educational opportunities for all people of all ages?

Third, we must join Illich and his colleagues in research into radical alternatives to the schooling syndrome, especially as such alternatives would affect adult education. It is difficult to indicate precisely what form this research should take, but it is clear what kind of research is not called for. Illich referred to most of the 1300 papers presented to the American Educational Research Association convention in New York in February as dealing with how to "set, specify, and evaluate the personal goals of others (44)." He called such research "pornographic." Save us from this research focus which is now also innundating the field of adult education. It seems to us that adult educators, with our background in programs not unlike some of Illich's alternative proposals, would have much to contribute to research in educational alternatives. At the same time we would benefit immensely from applying some of the fresh insights which Illich's views would stimulate in other areas of our research. Freire's adult literacy program proposals also would be helpful here (16-19, 54).

It is our hope that, at the very least, this essay will encourage adult educators to read and study the works of Illich,

Reimer, and Freire. We believe you will immediately feel the bond of professional kinship to adult education so evident in their writings. Perhaps you will even go on to reexamine some of your basic assumptions about the field in a new light. Don't get set to be put off by the forceful tone of their writings or their call for revolutionary social changes. After all, Benjamin Franklin, the founding father of American adult education, was a revolutionary too.

Transition to Bibliography

Most of the interpretation, implications, and criticisms of the ideas of Illich and his colleagues presented above occurred to us when we were participants with twenty-eight others (in two sections of fifteen each) in a seminar examining their writings held during the Winter 1971 quarter in the graduate adult education area of the Ohio State University College of Education.

A few background words about that seminar might be in order. Before being admitted to the seminar, each potential participant was asked to read an article by Illich (33) to determine whether he found the material of interest and worth discussion. The seminar was conducted on a basis as close to Illich's peer-matching concept as possible (42, 48, 59). That is, the ordinary trappings of academia - grades, reading assignments, attendance requirements, term papers and tests - were done away with as much as possible. Each section selected its own readings and topics and handled its own discussion. At the first meeting each participant was handed a copy of an earlier version of the following bibliography and also a packet of xeroxed articles drawn from it. Though each section

varied, generally the participants found it worthwhile to examine Illich's writing first (33, 41, 42), then Reimer's essay (59), which some found easier to work with since it is written in more conventional academic style, concluding with the Freire material (16, 17, 19). During the seminar we listened to an audio-tape (40) and viewed a video-tape (32) of an Illich lecture. After the seminar was completed we participated in a long-distance conference telephone call with Illich in Cuernavaca, Mexico (47) using the Bell System's new tele-lecture equipment (Portable Conference Telephone Model 50-A) which permitted us all to hear him through a loud speaker as several of us posed questions to him and engaged in a discussion with him.

The bibliography which follows is in two parts. Both parts, instead of containing the conventional annotation, include brief quotations from the items to better give the reader a more direct, uninterpreted flavor of the writing listed. The first part covers those items by or about Illich, Reimer, Freire, or CIDOC. The second part contains items dealing with such related topics as religious issues (70, 79, 90); description of the current situations in schools (73, 80, 88, 92, 97, 98, 106, 112, 119, 137, 138, 140), colleges (91, 153), and adult education (69, 122, 127, 128, 129); other views on the "learning" or "educative" society (68, 72, 74, 78, 105, 109, 116, 117, 123, 134, 139); proposals for an educative future (71, 89, 91a, 100, 104, 107, 113, 114, 118, 121, 126, 130, 131, 133, 136, 144, 145, 146, 147, 148, 149, 151, 152); educational philosophy (154, 156); general social-political criticism about the U.S. scene (82, 83, 84, 85, 86, 93, 94, 95, 124, 125, 155), educa-

tional experiments now being conducted in schools (67, 87, 101, 132, 143) and in adult education (62, 63, 108, 141); psycho-social issues in education (65, 96, 102, 135); self-directed adult learning (110, 150); and other items cited by Illich or his colleagues (66, 76, 77, 103).

QUOTATIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHY

INTRODUCTORY STATEMENT: The quotations presented with the bibliographic items below are samples, but not necessarily representative samples, of the works cited. They are mainly statements by the authors cited that we find provocative.

ITEMS BY, OR ABOUT, IVAN ILLICH, EVERETT REIMER, PAULO FREIRE, OR THE CENTER FOR INTERCULTURAL DOCUMENTATION (CIDOC)

- (1) "Boot Camp for Urbanites," Time, (October 27, 1961), p. 65. A brief description of the Center soon after it was opened. "Illich and his staff deliberately make the students angry, start arguments, challenge cherished beliefs."
- (2) "Camara and Illich." Commonweal, Vol. 89, (Feb. 7, 1969), pp. 575-6.
Editorial: "Msgr. Illich is apparently paying the price for being one of the Church's most original and outspoken innovators...Illich is one of the Church's most valuable figures, not only for his commitment to radical change for Latin America but also for his desire to avoid the 'clericalism of the left' which sometimes infects progressive Catholic movements."
- (3) Center for Intercultural Documentation. Catalogo de Publicaciones 1970. Available free from the Center, APDO 479, Cuernavaca, Mor., Mexico. Lists the many publications of the Center in English and Spanish. Among the many publications of the Center is a special service called CIDOC DOCUMENTA/Alternatives in Education: "For the past two years, a group of people at CIDOC has been thinking about radical alternatives to the school system. Some of you have been with us in Cuernavaca and have shown that you share our concern, if not all our ideas. Others of you have written to us out of shared interest. We now ask you to actively collaborate with us by sharing information, ideas and critical judgments. Our medium for continued collaboration is CIDOC DOCUMENTA. The idea is simple. All documents which originate in our seminar, as well as any material considered especially significant by its members, will be reproduced at CIDOC and distributed to subscribers, who will be invited to send us critical comment or further documentation which they feel should be circulated among their colleagues. Each subscribing member will pay a \$25.00 introductory fee. Administrative expenses and printing costs will be defrayed out of this

deposit by charging 10 cents per page if there are 15 to 50 subscribers, 5 cents per page if there are between 50 and 120 subscribers, and 3 cents per page if there are more than 120 subscribers. Airmail postage will also be deducted from the \$25.00 deposit. Most documents will be in English. Those in other languages will not be translated. All members are encouraged to submit work-in-progress to the criticism of this circle of collaborators, before giving it wide circulation through means of communication which are less defined by common interest. The editor of this service, Dennis Sullivan, is a permanent member of the seminar on Alternatives in Education. He will have final responsibility for the selection of documents, as well as for introducing, annotating or condensing them when necessary. Preference in selection will be given to documents written by seminar participants. Among those who have already joined our discussions are Paul Goodman, John Holt, Jonathan Kozol, Carl Bereiter, Theodore Newcomb, Paulo Freire, Layman Allen, Fred Goodman and Luis Ratinoff. We hope that you will join us, not only by receiving the documents which originate in Cuernavaca, but also by critically responding with your own contributions to our common inquiry. Mail your introductory fee (\$25.00) to: Dennis Sullivan, CIDOC, APDO. 479, Cuernavaca, Mor., Mexico."

- (4) Center for Intercultural Documentation. Study in Cuernavaca: Course Catalogue. Available free from CIDOC, APDO. 479, Cuernavaca, Mor., Mexico. Provides a complete description of the Center plus course descriptions including those on Alternatives in Education.
- (5) Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions. "Toward A Society Without Schools," Center Report, IV, 1 (February, 1971). A Center Conference on the Deinstitutionalization of Education, November 19-20, 1970, with Center Associates and Fellows joined by Ivan Illich, Evertt Reimer, Angel Quintero, former minister of education for Puerto Rico, and Herman E. Daly, professor of ecology, Louisiana State University.

Illich: "I feel very badly about this whole thing frequently. I know that our criticism is destructive of one of the great creations (mass schooling) of the last two generations. It pulls the rug out from under the only ritual which at this moment keeps stability. It calls for a radical alternative which we cannot imagine, because I do not know how one imagines the sense of the future. It therefore opens the gates in a very much more subtle way than a politician would do to something as horrible as Jacobinism. The ideas which we profess about education are no less dangerous and destructive than the political ideas of The Enlightenment. I think the whole

argument stands and falls on our understanding of learning. If learning be the product of treatment we would end up with the totally taught society which almost necessarily leads to Vietnam."

- (6) "Controversial Priest: Ivan Illich: Man in the News," The New York Times, (Jan. 23, 1969), p. 2. " '(Illich) is not a man who comes out for things, ' a friend said. 'He asks -- that is his style. He is a man who has dug into the matter very deeply and who gets people to think about it. That's a much more effective threat for change than coming out for things.' "
- (7) Cowan, Wayne H. "An Interview with Ivan Illich," Christianity and Crisis, Vol. 29, No. 14, (Aug. 4, 1969), pp. 213-219. Illich: "I want to do away with a possible misleading conception. DICOC was founded only in 1964, while I came to Mexico with two friends -- Jerry Morris and Theodoro Stancioff -- in 1961....In addition to the language school we started a program for intercultural sensitivity development, mostly for missionaries on their way to Latin America. This organization was not CIDOC; it was the Center for Intercultural Formation (CIF).... Within CIF, right from the beginning, my room and two or three others remained reserved as a kind of a club, a kind of independent thinkery where people could get together on any subject, related always to the reaction of the human personality to social change....By 1963-64 Valentine Borremans, then our librarian (now CIDOC's Director), developed the library into a unique research tool on this kind of subject....(Those who came) also wanted to take part in little seminars in the library. So we set up a new organization called CIDOC, Center for Intercultural Documentation. Furthermore, we had come to the conviction by that time that most of the message we had wanted to get across to the religious orders had succeeded....(CIDOC is a) free club for the search of surprise (where we try) to keep open the platform between the Americas where people go who want to be surprised rather than to give or find an answer, a place where people go who want help in refining their questioning, rather than completing the answers they have gotten....At this moment, it is hardly possible to encourage independent thinking and rethinking...to encourage learning rather than to perfect teaching, to invite adults to explore where to go from a point they have barely reached and are not yet quite capable of formulating without asking them to come to clearer and more deadly correct formulations of what they thought yesterday. You can't engage in such types of educational proceedings without necessarily being accused of correcting these adults, of making them less loyal to the institutions with which they were associated, less true believers in the ideology of the institution....The main

theme of CIDOC is the study of the relationship between what I call religious or para-religious structures of thought and social change....I am not a contesting priest or a revolutionary priest or a clergyman organizing factions within the church or an apostolically interested ex-priest or a lay theologian....(I am) a clergyman who has worked as such and in order to do an academic job has entirely and totally renounced all privileges, titles, advantages of the clerical state, but who, at the same time, remains a very faithful, entirely orthodox believer in the church and lover of the church....The search for alternatives to the school system and their public discussion has a much more liberalizing effect and ultimately is much more revolutionary than the suggestion that one government now in power should be replaced by another as long as that government, too, supports the same value-oriented school system. The same thing could be repeated about the military as another value-oriented institution or, as we have said, though by now it is quite tertiary in importance, the church....I am not a prophet, and I do not want to become a futurologist. I think that what we should be concerned with here at CIDOC is to be humorists. That is, people who are constantly aware of the constraints and limitations of the categories with which we think, people who are continuously aware that through the development of imagination and by looking at flowers you can kind of imagine an analog to every social system that is just slightly off-key and, therefore, makes you smile. At CIDOC, in the seminar Everett Reimer directs and in which I have taken part for the last three years (it meets twice a year for a month), we have no intention of proposing concrete and specific applicable alternatives in front of a futuristic scenario for the present school system. But in this we attempt to develop a language in which one can speak about schools without ever making reference to education, and in which one can speak about education without continuously making reference to years of attendance, to school age, to promotion, to grades, to curriculum and similar ritual elements. What I personally hope can be achieved by this is freer thinking. Here I refer to Ernst Bloch and his distinction between the distant future, the abstract future -- that about which I can only think conceptually by extrapolating presently existing trends, about which I can speak with expectation but not with hope -- and that other future which is the generalization of the now-existing experiences, long-haired in the Thomas More sense, the utopic projection of what now exists and can be thought an extension into an expanded presence or, if you want, an imminent future about which I can speak with hope. CIDOC is primarily an educational institution; I want to emphasize this."

- (8) Cuneo, Paul K. "Review of Celebration of Awareness," Saturday Review (February 13, 1971).

"Celebration of Awareness; A Call for Institutional Revolution, by Ivan D. Illich, has the precious sort of title that could drive away scores of potential readers. That would be unfortunate, for this collection of previously published articles and talks contains some of the most lively, provocative, challenging opinions that are being expressed today."

- (9) Dolan, Dan. "The Life of Ivan Illich," New Republic, Vol. 160, (March 1, 1969), pp. 18-19. Dolan, a teaching fellow at the University of Pennsylvania, visited CIDOC and reports here on the Center and on Illich: "Tragedy is implicit in the situation, and many will not dare as he does."

- (11) Fiske, Edward B. "Vatican Curb Aimed at Cultural Center of Reform Advocate," The New York Times, (Jan. 23, 1969), pp. 1+. "Operating expenses (for CIDOC), which come to approximately \$240,000 a year, come from tuition, fees and from sale of publications." Illich: "I deeply regret the possibility that -- entirely against our will and because of this Roman decree -- my name and the name of this center should become the focal point for still another tragic round of disruptive and uncreative uproar within the church. Certainly none of us will join it."

- (12) Fiske, Edward B. "Head of Cultural Center Tells of Secret Hearing in Vatican," The New York Times, (Feb. 4, 1969), p. 2. "Msgr. Ivan Illich, leader of a controversial cultural center here (Cuernavaca), has made public highly classified documents describing a secret appearance before the Vatican Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, the former Holy Office....In Rome, Msgr. Luigi De Magistris, an official of the Congregation, refused to confirm or deny that Msgr. Illich had made such an appearance. 'For the press, we simply do not exist,' he said."

- (13) Fitzpatrick, Joseph P. "What Is He Getting At?" America, Vol. 116, No. 12, (March 25, 1967), pp. 444-449. "Part of the controversy is Msgr. Illich himself: his personality, his style, his methods. He is an amazingly brilliant man, who likes to have bright people around him and finds it difficult to conceal his disdain for what he considers stupidity. He is a polyglot genius who speaks nine languages almost without a trace of accent, a cosmopolite at home in any nation of Western Europe or the Western Hemisphere....He can turn on irresistible charm, or show brutal ridicule and disdain."

And he has a trace of Jewish ancestry that he exploits to the utmost....He has a vision of the radical changes the Church must undergo if it is to be Christ present to the men of the 21st century. And he is convinced that these changes cannot be achieved without violence to self -- and sometimes to others. 'I have come to bring not peace but a sword,' says the Lord. He punishes himself by work to such a degree that amateur psychiatrists have called him a masochist. In like manner, he punishes anyone who works with him....He is, therefore, and always will be a sign of contradiction and a focus of controversy."

- (14) Fonseca, Jaime. "Msgr. Illich Describes Goals and Spirit of CIDOC Center," Tablet (Brooklyn, New York) February 20, 1969, p. 4.

"Clarifying my remark that Christians should not use God for the cause of a system, I say I am partly influenced by my Jewish roots and resent the use of God's name. 'Hallowed by Thy name,' for any of our purposes. I repeat my hope that the Church people will understand that to use God's name for every good cause that comes along is just as blasphemous as claiming Him for a bad cause....There come moments in life when you abstain from judging people and their motives, even if one wonders. But yet you have to do your thing. You must do what has to be done. 'Justum es dignum est' - It is just, it is worthy. This is worthy. This is my most important message."

- (15) Foster, Philip. "A Comment on Everett Reimer's Book: 'An Essay on Alternatives in Education,'" 2nd ed. Rev. Publ. by CIDOC in Cuernavaca, 1970. 194 p. (CIDOC Cuadernos, 1005) Chicago, 1970, 29 pp. Centro Inter-cultural De Documentacion, DOC A/E 71/281.

"I concluded my reading of 'Alternatives in Education' with extraordinarily mixed feelings and I am sure that my reaction is fairly typical. This essay is a mixture of extraordinarily perceptive comment and reckless generalization...The reader will quickly discern that the author's plans are essentially utopian insofar as their successful implementation involves not only a total restructuring of education but simultaneous revolutionary change in all those societal sub-systems that are functionally linked with the educational enterprise. I must by contrast confess my personal adherence to the idea of 'piecemeal reform' and limited 'social engineering' as the only way of effecting useful change in educational institutions which, in my opinion, are not easily susceptible to rapid and massive transformation.

I start with the assumption that the school is 'here to stay' and that most people in most societies want it to stay - not because they are unable to see where their 'real' interests lie (only the utopians can perceive their 'real' interests) but because the school with all its manifold shortcomings does offer them some chance of a fuller life. I would submit there is some evidence that justifies this belief."

- (16) Freire, Paulo. "The Adult Literacy Process as Cultural Action for Freedom," Harvard Educational Review, Vol. 40, No. 2, (May 1970), pp. 205-225. First and second parts of an essay written while the author was a Fellow at the Center for the Study of Development and Social Change, Cambridge, Mass. 02138. Translated by Loretta Stover.

- (17) Freire, Paulo. "Cultural Action and Conscientization," Harvard Educational Review, Vol. 40, No. 2, (August 1970), pp. 452-477. Third part of Freire's essay "Conscientization: Cultural Action for Freedom" translated by Loretta Stover. First two parts appeared in May 1970 issue of this journal. "Conscientization refers to the process in which men, not as recipients, but as knowing subjects, achieve a deepening awareness both of the socio-cultural reality which shapes their lives and of their capacity to transform that reality."

- (18) Freire, Paulo. "Cultural Freedom in Latin America" in Human Rights and the Liberation of Man in the Americas. Edited by Louis M. Colonnese. Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 1970. "The more the rise of the masses is emphasized in Latin America, the more the elite holding power, committed to foreign interests, will polarize against them....Cultural freedom in Latin America is the freedom of the leading classes to approach their culture, while using it as an instrument to forbid the popular classes the right of expression....True cultural freedom does not exist within the concrete situations of domination where, in the best of cases, even a disguised power elite assumes a paternalistic role, thinking for and by the popular classes, which means against them. Cultural freedom is not a gift but the conquered right of the popular classes to express themselves, an act which enables them to 'pronounce the world' and to live a continuous re-creation of it."

- (19) Freire, Paulo. Pedagogy of the Oppressed. 186 pages. Published at \$5.95 by Herder and Herder, 232 Madison Avenue, New York, New York 10016. 1970.

From the jacket: "In the course of Freire's work and travels in the Third World and as a result of his studies in the philosophy of education, he evolved a theory for the education of illiterates, especially adults, based on

the conviction that every human being, no matter how 'ignorant' or submerged in the 'culture of silence,' is capable of looking critically at his world in a dialogical encounter with others, and that provided with the proper tools for such an encounter he can gradually perceive his personal and social reality and deal critically with it. When an illiterate peasant participates in this sort of educational experience he comes to a new awareness of self, a new sense of dignity; he is stirred by a new hope. As the illiterate learns, his world becomes radically transformed and he is no longer willing to be a mere object responding to changes occurring around him. He is more likely to decide to take upon himself, with his fellow men, the struggle to change the structures of society that until now have served to repress him."

- (20) Giniger, Henry. "Mexican Center Trains New Kind of Priest for Latin America," The New York Times, (Dec. 26, 1965), p. 15. Illich: "We are training people to have a deep sense of humility, who will seek to make their faith relevant to the society in which they will be working, who will be sensitive to what ordinary people want; then in turn will be able to show them that, whatever they are fighting for, they can find a new dimension in human love."

- (21) Grabowski, Stanley M. "The Center of Intercultural Formation at Cuernavaca," Occasional Bulletin. Vol. XVII, No. 4 (April 1966), 5 pp. (From the Missionary Research Library, P. O. Box 590, Manhattenville Station, New York, New York 10027; (Price 35 cents)

"One of the reasons why the CIF escapes accurate analysis is its steady state of change. The rapid changes in the very fluid program are at once the great asset of this contemporary program as well as the source of much criticism..By the time this article appears in print, the program it describes may already be abandoned for a newer one....Financial resources are only a small part of the insecurity which is built into the CIF. Everything about Latin America is insecure. For this reason Msgr. Illich wants to preserve an atmosphere of insecurity in the entire operation at Cuernavaca. In accordance with this philosophy, the hotel is only rented!...This insecurity and constant readiness to change is characteristic of Msgr. Illich, who says, If someone else is found to do the job for Latin America, we would and ought to get out. But there is no evidence, at the moment, that the CIF is going to get out now or in the near future. On the contrary, the diversified activities and projects started at the CIF seem to augur a long future for the Center."

- (22) Gray, Francine du Plessix. "Profiles: The Rules of the Game," The New Yorker, Vol. 46 (April 25, 1970), pp. 40-

44+. A biographical sketch of Illich. "Illich...had become one of the most admired, feared, and controversial priests in the American hemisphere....When Illich was asked recently to define his conception of grace, he replied, 'Another form of grace, in our time, can be attained through night school.' Illich believes deeply in adult education, and he would like to see all traditional school systems abolished, because, he says, they favor the privileged middle classes at the expense of marginal groups; only through a radically transformed system of adult education can the underprivileged rise from misery to the secular grace of enlightenment." (This article also appears in Miss Gray's book Divine Disobedience: Profiles in Catholic Radicalism, 1970)

- (23) Illich, Ivan. "Puerto Ricans in New York," Commonweal, (June 22, 1956), pp. 294-297. "Spanish-Christian tradition, a Catholicism in which is taken for granted an eminently Christian attitude toward the mixing of races, a freshness and simplicity of outlook proper to the tropics, a new pattern of political freedom in association with the United States, a bridge between the hemispheres politically and culturally no less than economically -- these are only a few of the assets that the mass migration of Puerto Ricans to the mainland can contribute to New York and the United States." This article also appears in Celebration of Awareness as "Not Foreigners, yet Foreign."
- (24) Illich, Ivan. "The Seamy Side of Charity," America, Vol. 116, (Jan. 21, 1967), pp. 88-91. Subtitled: An authority on the Church in Latin America makes some blunt statements about American missionary work in South America. "When it (the Church) is threatened by real change, it withdraws rather than permit social awareness to spread like wildfire....The U.S. missionary tends to fulfill the traditional role of a colonial power's lackey chaplain." This article also appears in Celebration of Awareness.
- (25) Illich, Ivan. "The Vanishing Clergyman," The Critic, Vol. 25, No. 6, (June-July 1967), pp. 18-27. (This magazine is published by The Thomas More Association, 180 N. Wabash Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60601.) This article also appears in Celebration of Awareness. "The Roman Church is the world's largest non-governmental bureaucracy. It employs 1.8 million full-time workers -- priests, brothers, sisters, and laymen....Men suspect that it has lost its relevance to the gospel and to the world. Wavering, doubt, and confusion reign among its directors, functionaries, and employees. The giant begins to totter before it collapses...I would like to suggest that we welcome the disappearance of institutional bureaucracy in a spirit of deep joy...The Church will discover new faith and power in the revealed word. It will teach through a living and intimate liturgy

centered around this word. Small Christian communities will be nourished in its joyful celebration."

- (26) Illich, Ivan. "The Futility of Schooling in Latin America," Saturday Review, Vol. 51, (Apr. 20, 1968), pp. 57-59+. "A second, frequently discussed remedy for the failure of schools is fundamental, or adult education. It has been proved by Paulo Freire in Brazil that those adults who can be interested in political issues of their community can be made literate within six weeks of evening classes. The program teaching such reading and writing skills, of course, must be built around the emotion-loaded key words of their political vocabulary. Understandably, this fact has gotten his program into trouble. It has been equally suggested that the dollar-cost of ten separate months of adult education is equal to one year of early schooling, and can be incomparably more effective than schooling at its best. Unfortunately, 'adult education' now is conceived principally as a device to give the 'underprivileged' a palliative for the schooling he lacks. The situation would have to be reviewed if we wanted to conceive of all education as an exercise in adulthood. We should consider a radical reduction of the length of the formal, obligatory school sessions to only two months each year -- but spread this type of formal schooling over the first twenty or thirty years of a man's life. While various forms of in-service apprenticeship in factories and programmed math and language teaching could assume a large proportion of what we have previously called 'instruction', two months a year of formal schooling should be ample time for what the Greeks meant by 'scholē' -- leisure for the pursuit of insight." This essay also appears in Celebration of Awareness as "The Futility of Schooling."
- (27) Illich, Ivan. "Violence: A Mirror for Americans," America, Vol. 118, (April 27, 1968), pp. 568-570. "I submit that foreign gods (ideals, idols, ideologies, persuasions, values) are more offensive to the 'poor' than the military or economic power of the foreigner....If I read present trends correctly, and I am confident I do, during the next few years violence will break out mostly against symbols of foreign ideas and the attempt to sell these. And I fear that this violence, which is fundamentally a healthy though angry and turbulent rejection of alienating symbols, will be exploited and will harden into hatred and crime." This article also appears in Celebration of Awareness.
- (28) Illich, Ivan. "Outwitting the 'Developed' Countries," New York Review of Books, date? Pages? Also appears as "Planned Poverty: The End Result of Technical Assistance" in Celebration of Awareness. "The world is reaching an

impasse where two processes converge: ever more men have fewer basic choices. The increase in population is widely publicized and creates panic. The decrease in fundamental choice causes anguish and is consistently overlooked. The population explosion overwhelms the imagination, but the progressive atrophy of social imagination is rationalized as an increase of choice between brands. The two processes converge in a dead end: the population explosion provides more consumers for everything from food to contraceptives, while our shrinking imagination can conceive of no other ways of satisfying their demands except through the packages now on sale in the admired societies....The intense promotion of schooling leads to so close an identification of school attendance and education that in everyday language the two terms are interchangeable. Once the imagination of an entire population has been 'schoolled,' or indoctrinated to believe that school has a monopoly on formal education, then the illiterate can be taxed to provide free high school and university education for the children of the rich....The only feasible answer to ever increasing underdevelopment is a response to basic needs that is planned as a long-range goal for areas which will always have a different capital structure. It is easier to speak about alternatives to existing institutions, services, and products than to define them with precision. It is not my purpose either to paint a Utopia or to engage in scripting scenarios for an alternate future. We must be satisfied with examples indicating simple directions that research should take....I am calling for research on alternatives to the products which now dominate the market; to hospitals and the profession dedicated to keeping the sick alive; to schools and the packaging process which refuses education to those who are not of the right age, who have not gone through the right curriculum, who have not sat in a classroom a sufficient number of successive hours, who will not pay for their learning with submission to custodial care, screening, and certification or with indoctrination in the values of the dominant elite....Money is now spent largely on children, but an adult can be taught to read in one-tenth the time and for one-tenth the cost it takes to teach a child. In the case of the adult there is an immediate return on the investment, whether the main importance of his learning is seen in his new insight, political awareness, and willingness to assume responsibility for his family's size and future, or whether the emphasis is placed on increased production. There is a double return in the case of the adult, because not only can he contribute to the education of his children, but to that of other adults as well. In spite of these advantages, basic literacy programs have little or no support in Latin America, where schools have a first call on all public

resources. Worse, these programs are actually ruthlessly suppressed in Brazil and elsewhere, where military support of the feudal or industrial oligarchy has thrown off its former benevolent disguise."

- (29) Illich, Ivan. "Monsignor Illich's Letter to Cardinal Seper," America, Vol. 120, (Feb. 15, 1969), pp. 187-189. Illich's letter written June 18, 1968 after he was called to Rome and an attempt was made to interrogate him in secret.

- (30) Illich, Ivan. "La Metamorfosis de la escuela," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 1, (1970). pp. 4-11. Spanish text of Illich's commencement address to the University of Puerto Rico, June 6, 1969. (An English translation is available, without charge, by writing to Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario.) A slightly different form of this address appears as "Commencement at the University of Puerto Rico" in the New York Review of Books magazine, and as "School: The Sacred Cow" in Illich's book Celebration of Awareness. "The 'age of schooling' began about two hundred years ago. Gradually the idea grew that schooling was a necessary means of becoming a useful member of society. It is the task of this generation to bury that myth....I expect that by the end of this century, what we now call school will be a historical relic, developed in the time of the railroad and the private automobile and discarded along with them. I feel sure that it will soon be evident that the school is as marginal to education as the witch doctor is to public health....There is no intrinsic reason why the education that schools are now failing to provide could not be acquired more successfully in the setting of the family, of work, and communal activity, in new kinds of libraries and other centers that would provide the means of learning. But the institutional forms that education will take in tomorrow's society cannot be clearly visualized. Neither could any of the great reformers anticipate concretely the institutional styles that would result from their reforms. The fear that new institutions will be imperfect, in their turn, does not justify our servile acceptance of present ones....The basic purpose of public education should be to create a situation in which society obliges each individual to take stock of himself and his poverty. Education implies a growth of an independent sense of life and a relatedness which go hand in hand with increased access to, and use of, memories stored in the human community. The educational institution provides the focus for this process. This presupposes a place within the society in which each of us is awakened by surprise; a place of encounter in which others surprise me with their liberty and make me aware of my own....My friends, it is your task to surprise yourselves,

and us, with the education you succeed in inventing for your children. Our hope of salvation lies in our being surprised by the Other. Let us learn always to receive further surprises. I decided long ago to hope for surprises until the final act of my life -- that is to say, in death itself."

- (31) Illich, Ivan. 1970 Beecher Lectures. These lectures were read at the Divinity School of Yale University on February 16-18, 1970. They have been printed in pamphlet form by the Center for Intercultural Documentation "for the exclusive use of participants in El Ciclo, Spring Term 1970" as CIDOC Cuaderno No. 1002, 1970. (They may be available at \$2.00 from Center for Intercultural Documentation, APDO 479, Cuernavaca, Mor, Mexico.) Since my copy of these lectures is marked "Not for publication -- Private" it would not seem appropriate to quote from them here. It appears likely that much of the material will appear in the book Deschooling Society (see bibliographic item below under that title). However, it is important to point out that these lectures reveal that Illich is not caught up in the typical view of education (as opposed to schooling) as primarily an activity of childhood. In fact, he questions the worth of the very concept "childhood." His natural acceptance of the view that education is properly a "lifelong" activity (without using such cliches as "lifelong learning") makes his writings, including these lectures, of great interest to adult educators.

- (32) Illich, Ivan. The Institutionalization of Truth. This is a videotape of a lecture (about 55 minutes) delivered in the spring of 1970 at York University in Toronto, Canada. It is on 1/2 inch Shibaden tape. (For information on availability write to Mr. Reg Herman, Managing Editor, Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.) This lecture places Illich's thoughts about schools within the context of his opposition to the worldwide drive toward economic development.

- (33) Illich, Ivan. "Why We Must Abolish Schooling," New York Review of Books, Vol. 15, No. 1, (July 2, 1970), pp. 9-15. "The most radical alternative to school would be a network of service which gives each man the same opportunity to share his current concern with others motivated by the same concern....Both the exchange of skills and matching of partners are based on the assumption that education for all means education by all....We must learn to measure the social value of work and leisure by the educational give-and-take for which they offer opportunity. Effective participation in the politics of a street, a work place, the library, a news program or

hospital is therefore the best measuring stick to evaluate their level as educational institutions." Drawn from The Beecher Lectures.

- (34) Illich, Ivan. "Ivan Illich Writes Pope Paul," Commonweal, Vol. XCII, No. 18, (Sept. 4, 1970), pp. 428-429. "Holy Father: I must censure your silence. Respectfully, firmly and publicly I must do so. For two years, it has been your duty to speak out against systematic torture of its political prisoners by the military government of Brazil with the same vehement indignation with which you have denounced the killing by Uruguayan insurgents of an American police technician. You have failed in this duty, just as you have again and again refused to speak out personally against specific acts of inhumanity on the part of men who are in government and power in Latin America.. ..I do not claim that my personal vocation to pacifism gives me the right to condemn others who do not share it, who have chosen the way of violence: the policeman, the soldier, the rebel. But I do claim the right -- I recognize my duty -- to single out specific deeds that I hear cry to heaven, deeds that do violence to the decency that even their perpetrators claim to honor....Your humble and obedient servant, Ivan Illich."
- (35) Illich, Ivan. Ciclo Lectures Summer 1970. Cuernavaca, Mexico: CIDOC, 1970. (Order at \$4.00 from CIDOC, APDO 479, Cuernavaca, Mor., Mexico). Eight essays prepared, among other reasons, "to provide material for discussion during the four-month term on Alternatives in Education which will gather several hundred people in Cuernavaca between January and April 1971." Includes "Why We Must Abolish Schooling" from July 2, 1970 New York Review of Books and a part of the Beecher Lectures 1970. In addition, one essay "The Ritualization of Progress" is similar to "Schooling: The Ritual of Progress" in the Dec. 3, 1970 issue of the New York Review of Books. The other five essays are "The Dawn of Epimethean Man," "The Institutional Spectrum," "Fragments for the Left Hand," "Four Educational Networks," and "Dissidence, Deviance and Delinquency in Style." "Man has developed the frustrating omnipotence to be unable to demand anything because he also cannot visualize anything which an institution cannot do for him. Surrounded by omnipotent tools, man is reduced to a tool of his tools. Each of the institutions meant to exercise one of the primeval evils has become a fail-safe self-sealing coffin for man....If we opt for more and better instruction, society will move toward domination by a sinister school and totalitarian teachers. Doctors, generals and policemen will continue to serve as secular arms for the educator. There will be no winners in the deadly game, but only exhausted frontrunners, a

straining middle sector and the mass of stragglers who must be bombed out of their fields into the rat race of urban life....A good educational institution is one whose operation sets into motion the demand for no more than its minimum use. Access to school comes only in large chunks. Even when the curriculum is highly flexible and permits all kinds of nibbling, the decision to bite in always implies self-definition as a student for a substantial and definitive period of time. The desirable educational institution would facilitate use at any time and for any amount....The school planner puts people together into classes. The educational planner builds channels that can be used to put resources together in unlimited combinations. Schools use resources to provide time, space, motivation and company for selected persons, and to make them share in a package of educational processes called a curriculum. An ideal learning network allows access to all resources which fit on its channels for all learners at all moments of their lives....To de-school means to abolish the power of one man to oblige another man to attend a meeting. It also means recognizing the right of any man, of any age, to call a meeting. This right has been drastically diminished by the institutionalization of meetings. 'Meeting' originally referred to the result of an act of gathering. Now it is a substantive referring to the institutional product of some agency."

- (36) Illich, Ivan. "The False Ideology of Schooling," Saturday Review, (October 17, 1970), pp. 56-58+. Reprinted from Great Ideas Today-1970 published by Encyclopedia Britannica. "The cultural revolutionary risks the future on the educability of man." Also appears in Celebration of Awareness as "A Constitution for Cultural Revolution." In the Saturday Review about three paragraphs are cut out at the end.

- (37) Illich, Ivan. "Should We Abolish Our Schools?" Weekend Magazine, (Oct. 24, 1970), pp. 10-13. (This publication is available from P.O. Box 1538, Place d'Armes, Montreal 126, Quebec, Canada.) Illich adapts his ideas to the Canadian scene. "Education is a matter of helping someone find his own way, with the help of lessons already learned, but without the process being dictated by the established wisdom. I can think of no better way of doing this than by bringing people together around the title of a book, record, article or film about which they want to know more....The idea of getting people together to exchange skills and knowledge presumes that we are willing to mobilize all the educational resources of a society, instead of pretending that they are locked up inside the school. It implies a commitment to making the world an educational place to grow up in. Certainly, work would have to be

redefined in terms of its educational value. Education would also have to be conceived as the whole process of growing up, and not something with a beginning and an end measured by school age. We have made education into a process which is preparatory to, rather than a continuing part of, life -- a process which follows patterns predetermined by educators and which is measured as successful in terms that have nothing to do with what is known. To bring about an educational revolution will require that men stop putting such a high price on access to a society. We are all considerably less than we think school has made us, though we owe much of our privilege and power to our successful running of the school race. We must recover our manhood and invent ways to share it freely."

- (38) Illich, Ivan. Celebration of Awareness: A Call for Institutional Revolution. Garden City, N.Y.: Doubleday & Co., 1970. 189 pages. (Available at \$5.95 from Doubleday & Co., 501 Franklin Avenue, Garden City, New York 11531.) Gathered here are some of Illich's "occasional writings" presented as originally given but with brief introductory statements. Introduction by Erich Fromm. Four not previously published items appear here: "A Call to Celebration," a manifesto presented at the time of the "March on the Pentagon" in 1967 ("In order to persuade the citizen that he controls his destiny, that morality informs decisions, and that technology is the servant rather than the driving force, it is necessary today to distort information. The ideal of informing the public has given way to trying to convince the public that forced actions are actually desirable actions.... The celebration of man's humanity through joining together in the healing expression of one's relationships with others, and one's growing acceptance of one's own nature and needs, will clearly create major confrontations with existing values and systems. The expanding dignity of each man and each human relationship must necessarily challenge existing systems."); "The Eloquence of Silence," some "points for meditation" presented to a Spanish language workshop in the 1950's ("The pregnant pauses between sounds and utterances become luminous points in an incredible void: as electrons in the atom, as planets in the solar system....With Confucius we can see language as a wheel. The spokes centralize, but the empty spaces make the wheel."); "The Powerless Church," a speech on the role of the church in social change and development delivered to a conference of Anglican church secretaries for social action in April, 1967 ("Social innovation is becoming an increasingly complex process. Innovative action must be taken with increasing frequency and sophistication. This requires men who are courageous, dedicated,

willing to lose their careers. I believe that this innovative action will increasingly be taken by groups committed to radically humanist ideals, and not gospel authority, and should therefore not be taken by churches.. ..We will need ideological rationalizations for a long time to achieve purposefully planned inventive solutions to social problems. Let consciously secular ideology assume this task. I want to celebrate my faith for no purpose at all."); and "Sexual Power and Political Potency," a speech given to a meeting of population experts in 1967 ("Within the present political and social context, it is impossible to induce the majority of the people to adopt birth control. Neither seduction nor current efforts at education work. To seduce effectively, the marketing of birth control would have to become more aggressive: twenty-five dollars offered for the insertion of each coil, one hundred dollars for each sterilization. To educate effectively, governments would be promoting their own subversion through sudden and widespread adult education. For it is clear that the education that enables adults to formulate their own dissent risks the loss of all constraints on freedom and imagination....My suggestion to orient large-scale formal educational programs for adults intensively toward family planning implies a commitment in favor of a political education. The struggle for political liberation and popular participation in Latin America can be rooted in new depth and awareness if it will spring from the recognition that, even in the most intimate domains of life, modern man must accept technology as a condition. Conducted in this style, education to modern parenthood could become a powerful form of agitation to help an uprooted mass grow into 'people'.")

- (39) Illich, Ivan. The Church, Change and Development. New York: Herder and Herder, 232 Madison Ave. N.Y., N.Y. 10016 (Bookstore orders should be directed exclusively to Herder and Herder): Urban Training Center Press, 21 E. Van Buren, 60605: (Correspondence concerning reprints, copyrights and reviews should be addressed to U.T.C.) - 1970, 175 pp., paperback copy, \$2.45....(From the introduction by James P. Morton, Director of UTC) "The time has come for some one to bring together a thematic collection of Ivan Illich's speeches, unpublished manuscripts, letters and articles, and it is appropriate that the Urban Training Center do so. For the past several years, people at the two centers, Cuernavaca and Chicago, have each worked at defining the problems of Christian ministry in the context of social action, and since 1967 this parallel research and training has been united in twenty-four hour conversations every two or three months....The papers span the 60's, reaching in one instance as far back as 1957, with the majority between 1965-69. They address the problems of

the mission of the Church in a period of accelerating technological change; in relation to controversy and revolutionary action, in the midst of community and national development, - all major questions on the theological agenda of the decade. In each case, Illich's answer is against the mainstream. Illich stands apart from the dominant style of social action advocated by the churches: first, by insisting upon a clear distinction between Christian mission and any particular social program. Second, by warning that the Church's self understanding (let alone her witness in the world) will come into grave peril if ever her unique mission on the one hand, and a program of action on the other hand, are simply identified one with the other....although Illich's latest and 'notorious' speeches engage the immediate and most obviously painful aspects of the dilemma at hand, the earlier papers provide a theoretical structure which may prove in the long run to be the deeper resource....Contrary to enthusiastic attempts to mirror the Gospel in the current popular milieu....Illich uses the apophatic logic of classical negative theology to mark the consistency of revelation....Illich constructs a grammar in which silence is the highest mode of communication, poverty the vehicle for carrying the most meaningful, creative and richest act, and powerlessness the means for demonstrating authoritative control: a language finally in which the autonomy of the spontaneous and the surprising is established over against the planned, of the ludicrous as opposed to the useful, and of the gratuitous in the face of the purposeful....one returns made more rich by a surprising discovery; what was offered first a decade ago as a very special case - the training of a nun to anticipate creatively the cultural shock of living as a stranger among an adopted people - may be the needed key for every man and group and institution in 1970." (Prepared by Richard Dodd.)

- (40) Illich, Ivan. Alternatives in Education. Audio-tape. About two hours. (Order at \$5.00 from Reg Herman, Managing Editor, Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada). This is a tape of a lecture delivered by Illich at the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education on December 2, 1970. The chairman of the meeting announced that he had been informed by Illich that this was the last time he would talk on education and that he now hopes to move on to other things and leave the problems of education to other people or people he had managed to convert. Illich: "What we now call 'the crisis in education' is mostly a result of an effort to make the facts of life as we live them fit into our dogma that schools are necessary, mainly because 'the poor ought to be put into schools.' We believe that people will not find time or motivation to learn unless they are either bribed or compelled. The

more we are liberals and concerned with people, the more we are convinced that the poorer a person is the more he must be bribed or compelled to submit to our educational treatment....The aim of the de-schooling of society must not be confused with two trends which are critical of the school system and, which though opposed, only seek to substitute schools....Let me call the first trend of those who want simply to substitute schools, the Jacobins, and the second one, the Bourbons. The Jacobin educator would seek to expand his right to teach everywhere, to teach far beyond the scholastic district. He would make us depend more on planned and engineered processes in learning and deliver his services more persuasively through channels which touch us more intimately than a seat in a classroom -- media of all kinds. He would escalate the public reliance on the knowledge industry and further discredit the auto-didact, the self-learner. His alternative to school is the attempt to transform society into a classroom, into a school....The Bourbon wants to substitute the vulgar universal schools of the Jacobin with more selective ones for the elite of his choosing....Now my ideal is exactly the opposite of what both the Bourbons and the Jacobins propose....I trust men constantly to use their hearts and their brains. I want to live in a transparent society in which each moment of life is surprising and with meaningful participation in mutual education. I want to live in mutual education up to the moment, and in the moment, of my death. I see human perfection in the progressive elimination of the institutional intermediary between man and the truth which he wants to learn." Approximately the last half of the tape is devoted to a question and answer session with the audience. The tape is seven inch, 3 3/4 i.p.s. half-track.

- (41) Illich, Ivan. "Schooling: The Ritual of Progress," New York Review of Books, Vol. 15, No. 10, (Dec. 3, 1970), pp. 20-25. "The school-leaving age in developed nations outpaces the rise in life expectancy. The two curves will intersect in a decade and create a problem for Jessica Mitford and professionals concerned with 'terminal education'....No one completes school -- yet. It never closes its doors on anyone without first offering him one more chance: at remedial, adult, and continuing education.... A whole society is initiated into the Myth of Unending Consumption of services. This happens to the degree that token participation in the open-ended ritual is made compulsory and compulsive everywhere. School directs ritual rivalry into an international game which obliges competitors to blame the world's ills on those who cannot or will not play....The totally destructive and constantly progressive nature of obligatory instruction will fulfill

its ultimate logic unless we begin to liberate ourselves right now from our pedagogical hubris, our belief that man can do what God cannot, namely manipulate others for their own salvation." This article will appear in a different form in De-Schooling Society.

- (42) Illich, Ivan. "Education Without School: How It can be Done," New York Review of Books, Vol. 15, No. 12, (Jan. 7, 1971), pp. 25-31. A different form of this article will appear in De-Schooling Society. "The alternative to dependence on schools is not the use of public resources for some new device which 'makes' people learn; rather it is the creation of a new style of educational relationship between man and his environment....In this essay, I intend to show that the inverse of school is possible: That we can depend on self-motivated learning instead of employing teachers to bribe or compel the student to find time and the will to learn; that we can provide the learner with new links to the world instead of continuing to funnel all educational programs through the teacher....A good educational system should have three purposes: it should provide all who want to learn with access to available resources at any time in their lives; empower all who want to share what they know to find those who want to learn it from them; and finally, furnish all who want to present an issue to the public with the opportunity to make their challenge known."
- (43) Illich, Ivan. "De-Schooling The Teaching Orders" America. Vol. 124, No. 1 (January 9, 1971) pp. 12-14. "In the next few years, most educators will learn to distinguish clearly between educational reform and educational revolution. They will learn that neither more dynamic styles in the classroom, nor more opening of classroom windows onto the world, nor more efficient teaching machines, nor larger bank accounts can make the schools more credible. And therefore, in increasing numbers, those educators will join the worldwide movement to abolish obligatory, government-sponsored, government-financed schooling....During the same period, the general public will recognize the same set of facts and achieve the same insight. The public will see that school is a ritual that hides from its participants the contradiction between the myth of compulsory learning for the sake of equality that provides the rationale for schools and the reality of a consumer society whose main products are the extension of social inequality and the creation of unfilled (and unfulfillable) desire in the individual consumer....More than any other group of teachers, the religious are free to provide mature leadership for the movement to disestablish schools, to lead in the demystification of the ritual of school, a ritual that supports the world's consumer societies. Their commitment

to poverty sets them apart from self-serving bureaucracies like teachers' unions and enables them joyfully to renounce the institutions they have served. Their celibacy renders them less vulnerable to the anguish that will accompany a radical transformation in human-rearing patterns. Their desire obediently to interpret for today's world the educational intentions of their founders will help them to remain faithful to their vocation as educators. Realizing that the poor cannot be schooled, they could lead the deschooling of society. All depends on the power of the gospel to upset their blessed self-image."

- (44) Illich, Ivan. "Draft for an address to the American Educational Research Association meeting in New York, February 6, 1971." Centro Intercultural de Documentacion, Doc. A/E 71/282. "America's commitment to the compulsory education of its young now reveals itself to be as futile as the American commitment to compulsory democratization of the Vietnamese. Conventional schools obviously cannot do it. The free-school-movement entices unconventional educators, but ultimately does so in support of the conventional ideology of schooling. And the promises of educational technologists, that their research and development - if adequately funded - can offer some kind of final solution to the resistance of youth to compulsory learning, sound as confident and prove as fatuous as the analogous promises made by the military technologists....It is easy for society to build up a sense of its responsibility for the education of the new generation, and this inevitably means that some men may set, specify and evaluate the personal goals of others. How this can be done is the subject of most of the 1300 papers presented at the 307 meetings planned for this convention. A slow reading of their titles leads the imagination into the swamp of the pornography of power - and pornography of bad quality by people who are not aware of their hubris. My pornographic imagination was stimulated by this unconscious display of pretended power over pupils....At some time during the last two generations a commitment to therapy triumphed whose ministrations all men need, if they wish to enjoy the equality and freedom with which, according to the constitution, they are born. Now the teacher therapists go on to propose life-long educational treatment as the next step. The style of this treatment is under discussion: Should it take the form of continued adult classroom attendance? Electronic ecstasy? Or periodic sensitivity sessions? All educators are ready to conspire to push out the walls of the classroom with the goal of transforming the entire culture into a school."

- (45) Illich, Ivan. "This Book Is About Schools." The New York Times Book Review. (March 21, 1971), pp. 47-48. A review

by Illich of This Book is About Schools. Edited by Satu Repo, the book, 457 pp., is available for \$7.95, New York: Pantheon Books. In their therapeutic orientation, the new (free) schools support the prevailing echos. Like the public system from which they split, they rely on professional treatment to create the new man, whether he be democrat, socialist, nationalist or all of these at once. They lay the burden for carrying out social reform on the child, who is supposed to grow into the new man within a utopian reality enclave called school. The difference between the traditional and the new school is mainly one of the degree and style in which school is different from the everyday world....This book is about schools. It is not about education. The authors are concerned with society's pedagogical obligations to the young rather than with the political goal of increased opportunities for all to live a meaningful life and thereby learn what they want."

- (46) Illich, Ivan. "From Cuernavaca," Center Report, IV, 2 (April 1971). "...thanks for the excellent report on our meeting. I admire your ability to produce something so terse and clean. On page 4, column 3, line 25 there is a misquote. School is age-specific, not a-specific." (Refers to material in item #5.)

- (47) Illich, Ivan. Telephone Conversation with Ivan Illich. Audio-tape of an amplified long distance telephone conversation with Illich made on April 16, 1971. For about 35 minutes students and faculty at Ohio State University in Columbus, Ohio questioned Illich in Cuernavaca, Mexico about his ideas on de-schooling. (For information on availability write to John Ohliger at the address on the last page of this bibliography.)

- (48) Illich, Ivan. De-Schooling Society. 144 page book to be published in late May or early June, 1971 by Harper and Row Publishers, Inc., 49 E. 33rd Street, New York, New York 10016 at \$6.00 as Volume 44 in their World Perspective series. It appears that this book will be a revised and expanded version of the following articles: "Why We Must Abolish Schooling (33)," "A Phenomenology of School (in 35)," "Schooling: The Ritual of Progress (41)," "The Institutional Spectrum (in 35)," "Education Without School: How It Can Be Done (42)," and "The Dawn of Epimethean Man (in 35)." Some of the material also appears in The Beecher Lectures (31). If the reader is only going to obtain one of the items in this whole bibliography, this should be it.

- (49) Illich, Ivan and John Cogley. Yesterday I Could Not Sleep Because Yesterday I Wrote My Name. Audio-tape. 42 minutes, 9 seconds. (Order as Tape #299 from the Center for the

Study of Democratic Institutions, P.O. Box 4446, Santa Barbara, California 93103. Price: \$7.50. Available either on five-inch 3 3/4 i.p.s. half track tapes or on cassettes. Free study guide available with tape on request.) Illich: "Schools mostly render people capable of receiving instruction from industry and from authority. That's the best thing they do....Paulo Freire, I consider as my teacher....Of course, Paulo Freire today is in exile as practically every adult educator in Latin America at this moment is in exile or in jail or some other way restrained....Education is a political concept....Fundamental education is the key to control of political power....I do believe that it would be a grave mistake to plan revolutionary strategy on a Leninist model, that it is really just necessary to see how my group rather than the other has control over the major value-oriented institutions of society....It is much more effective to rethink the alienated aspects of the most highly valued institution -- the school....What we have to achieve over the next three to five years is a great sense of humor and of ridicule related to that particular religious institution, which is the universal, not church but, school....We must begin by saying that in the name of education we want to get rid of the school."

- (50) Illich, Ivan and Donald McDonald and Denis Goulet. A Privileged Place. Audio-tape. 21 minutes, 20 seconds. (Order as Tape #483 at \$7.50 from The Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, P.O. Box 4446, Santa Barbara, California 93103. Available on either five-inch 3 3/4 i.p.s. half-track or on cassettes. Study guide available free with tape on request.) A segment from a long conversation recorded at the Santa Barbara Center where Illich talked with Donald McDonald and Denis Goulet about the role of the Catholic Church in Latin America, how it functions and how it should function. Illich: "I do not believe that my knowledge that when I'm speaking to you, speaking to a brother, in the God-man, to a member of the Church, and if I speak to him who is not consciously a Christian, I'm still speaking to a man redeemed, changes anything, and may ever change anything, in the orientation which our planning for different educational systems will take."
- (51) "Ivan Illich." in Current Biography, 1969. pp. 217-220. Biographical sketch with quotations from a number of articles about Illich.
- (52) Johnson, William. "Priest in Eye of RC Mission Storm," The Globe and Mail. (February 8, 1969) Toronto. "Among the non-school methods of education he (Illich) proposes is turning factories into vast training centers for on-

the-job or off-hour education. But he points out that educational innovation sufficient to meet Latin American needs will not come about without transforming the society.

'Radical innovation in formal education presupposes radical political changes, radical changes in the organization of production, and radical changes in man's image of himself as an animal which needs school,' he said."

- (53) "Msgr. Illich Leaves Priesthood," Christian Century, (April 16, 1969), p. 503. "Msgr. Ivan Illich has 'irrevocably' resigned from the Catholic priesthood. The controversial priest, who in 1961 founded the Cuernavaca center with the sponsorship of the late Francis Cardinal Spellman, has been under heavy criticism by Vatican officials in recent months, and last January the center itself was banned to all priests and nuns by the Vatican. Summoned to the Vatican and confronted with a long list of questions about his theological and political views, Msgr. Illich refused to take an oath of secrecy and declined to answer the questions on the ground that they were prejudicially stated. His stand was supported by the National Catholic Reporter and other Catholic journals and by several Catholic canon lawyers. Msgr. Illich's resignation extends to the title of 'monsignor' and to the rights of a priest to say mass, preach, hear confessions and administer sacraments. However he will continue as a celibate and as director of the center."
- (54) "Paulo Freire," Convergence, Vol. 3, No. 3 (1970). In Spanish. (English translation available without charge from Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.) The article is abstracted from a report of the American Universities Field Staff, Inc., by Thomas G. Sanders, and from Terre Souterre, Paris, March-April, 1969. "Observers in Latin America no longer think of learning to read as acquiring mere technical skill, but as a process implying values, forming mentalities and leading to social and political consequences. The chief intellectual architect of this change is a Brazilian named Paulo Freire." Freire is quoted as saying: "Education is an act of love and for that very reason, an act of courage. It cannot fear debate and analysis of reality. It cannot flee from creative discussions for fear of being farcical It is not possible, with an autocratic education, to mould men who will play an active role in the exciting process of developing a democracy: such education is directly opposed to the emergence of a people into public life."
- (55) "People Not in the News: Monsignor Ivan Illich," Ramparts, Vol. 6, (June 15, 1968), p. 15. "Left-wing Catholic priests wearing Black Power tee shirts were passing out copies of

Ivan Illich's essay 'The Vanishing Clergyman' last summer like they were holy cards....Only a year ago last February, Cardinal Cushing, head of the U.S. Bishops' Committee for Latin America, pounded a Catholic podium and lambasted as a 'colossal lie' an essay of Illich's, 'The Seamy Side of Charity.'....Illich describes his secular institute (CIDOC) as a 'thinkery.'....The Center, says Msgr. Illich, is the 'only successful free university.' "

- (56) Pilder, William F. "Review of Celebration of Awareness: A Call for Institutional Revolution." Phi Delta Kappan (March 1971). Pilder is a faculty member of the Department of Urban Education, Indiana University. "Members of the educational establishment cannot ignore Illich's analysis without being guilty of blindly aggrandizing institutional forms that no longer serve the persons in whom they purport to be concerned."

- (57) Reimer, Everett. A videotape interview (about 25 minutes) conducted in early 1970 by J. Roby Kidd, Chairman, Department of Adult Education, Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, Toronto, Ontario, Canada. It is on 1 inch Sony tape. (For information on availability write to Mr. Reg Herman, Managing Editor, Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.) Tape deals primarily with the Reimer-Illich ideas as they apply to adult education.

- (58) Reimer, Everett. "Does the Shoe Fit? A Background Piece on the 'Silent Majority' " America. Vol. 23, No. 3 (January 23, 1971) pp. 69-70. "The culture of silence is one in which only the power elites exercise the right of choosing, of acting, of commanding, without the participation of the popular majority. The right of saying the word is exclusively theirs. The culture of silence is characterized by the muteness of the people, by the impossibility of participating in the decisions that involve their destiny As an educator, Freire is mainly concerned with educational means of freeing men from the bondage of the culture of silence. Not all so-called education has this result. While education for freedom will make men aware of their fatalist posture towards reality - such education implies unveiling reality, demythologizing it - education for domestication will insist upon keeping men alienated. Because of this, the first is a humanist action, and the second is action for dehumanization. Thus, education for domestication cannot hide its necrophiliac character."

- (59) Reimer, Everett. An Essay on Alternatives in Education. Cuernavaca, Mexico: Center for Intercultural Documentation, 1970 (May be ordered as CIDOC Cuaderno No. 1005 from CIDOC, APDO 479, Cuernavaca, Mor., Mexico.) This essay has now gone through three drafts or editions. It will go through

another revision and appear as a book (title not yet known though it may be Alternatives in Education) to be published by Doubleday and Company in September, 1971. In the introduction to item 48 Illich refers to the Reimer book as "a comprehensive and documented exposition....of our joint research." The third draft contains the following chapters: Why Alternatives to School?, What Schools Do, What Schools Are, How Schools Work, The History of Schooling, Schools and Other Institutions, Democratic Institutions, Education for Freedom, What People Need to Know, Network of Things, Networks of People, Financing Education, The Revolutionary Role of Education, Strategy For a Peaceful Revolution. CIDOC has also published a draft of the last chapter of the book as "What Each of Us Can Do" (CIDOC DOC. A/E 71/284) which contains material not in the Essay.

- (60) "Roman Catholics: Get Going and Don't Come Back," Time, (Feb. 14, 1969, pp. 48+. Description of Illich's trials and tribulations with the Catholic hierarchy. "The confrontation was inevitable....There is at least a hint that the Illich affair was more than a little disturbing to Rome."
- (61) Schrag, Peter. "Ivan Illich: The Christian as Rebel," Saturday Review, (July 19, 1969), pp. 14-19. "In his (Illich's) vision any genuine education tends to be political and revolutionary, and any real learning to be subversive. Birth control programs in Latin America have failed, Illich said, because they require forms of adult education that inevitably have political consequences and are therefore unwelcome to the military governments of the hemisphere. 'The political order cannot tolerate too much awareness, originality, and risk. Education of adults which is analytical and dialectic leads inevitably to a liberation from taboos. Idols cannot be knocked off selectively....The awareness that sex does not have to lead to unwanted motherhood provokes another: the insight that economic survival does not have to breed political exploitation. The freedom of the mate and the citizen lead over the same road.' Real adult education is far more radical than training guerrillas. Schooling on the other hand, teaches acquiescence."

OTHER ITEMS OF RELATED INTEREST

(Unless specifically stated, it is not indicated that any of the following items have influenced the thoughts of, or have been cited in the writings of, Illich, Reimer, or Freire.)

- (62) Alinsky, Saul D. Reveille for Radicals. New York: Vintage Books, 1969. 235 pp. (Paperback edition, \$1.65) "America's radicals are to be found wherever and whenever America moves close to the fulfillment of its democratic dream. Whenever America's hearts are breaking, there American radicals were and are. America was begun by its radicals. America was built by its radicals. The hope and future of America lies with its radicals....What is the American radical? The radical is that unique person who actually believes what he says. He is that person to whom the common good is the greatest personal value. He is that person who genuinely and completely believes in mankind. The radical is so completely identified with mankind that he personally shares the pain, the injustices, and the sufferings of all his fellow men....What does the radical want? He wants a world in which the worth of the individual is recognized. He wants the creation of a kind of society where all of man's potentialities could be realized; a world where man could live in dignity, security, happiness, and peace - a world based on a morality of mankind....To these ends radicals struggle to eradicate all those evils which anchor mankind in the mire of war, fears, misery, and demoralization. The radical is concerned not only with the economic welfare of the bodies of mankind but also with the freedom of the minds of men. It is for this that he attacks all those parts of any system that tend to make man a robot. It is for this that he opposes all circumstances which destroy the souls of men and make them fearful, petty, worried, dull sheep in men's clothing. The radical is dedicated to the destruction of the roots of all fears, frustrations, and insecurity of man, whether they be material or spiritual. The radical wants to see man truly free. Not just free economically and politically but also free socially. When the radical says complete freedom he means just that."
- (63) Alinsky, Saul. "The Professional Radical, 1970." Harner's. Vol. 240, No. 1436 (January 1970) pp. 35-42. "I've come to see very clearly that this country is predominantly middle-class economically. Almost four-fifths of our people are in that bracket, so that's where the power is. Hell, we would have to be blind not to see that this is where organization has to go....In some ways the middle-class groups are more alienated, more out of the scene even than the poor. There aren't any special funding programs for them. They don't have special admissions to universities. They don't have a special anything except getting constantly clobbered by taxes and inflation.... These people are just thrashing around in their own frustrations. They couldn't be effective allies for anyone because they're overcome, completely confused by their own problems."

- (64) Allen, Dwight. "Seven Educational Myths, And How They Mangle the Young," Psychology Today. (March, 1971). "Myths are powerful fantasies of how things ought to be. They make the world more comprehensive to their users. But when they have lost their interpretive usefulness, myths do not die easily; they tend to remain embedded in the culture. And one of the most serious problems facing our culture is the lingering presence of outmoded myths about the nature of education....What is so obstructive about our educational myths is that they have become ossified within the structure of our schools. The myths that haunt our classrooms have been there generation after generation....In a sense we are all unwilling captives - we shape our institutions and then our institutions shape us. But most of all it is the student who is a captive of the system, for he is essentially a wage-slave within it....First of all, we have a profit-motivated reward system in our schools. Students work to earn the grades by which the teachers pay them. Any student who refuses to work has his salary cut, or is laid off or fired outright....While such a school system is perhaps consistent with our capitalistic superstructure, it hardly makes for person-centered or liberating education. The child quickly learns that virtually everything he does will be evaluated in abstract absolute terms: good or bad. Yet, there is no such thing as bad learning. Learning is learning. Bad learning simply means that the learning does not fit into the program, a program that has been defined before the student is even brought into it and one that rarely bends to accept the unique differences of human beings."
- (65) Anderson, Walt. "Beyond the 'Minimal Person,' " A Review of Radical Man. By Charles Hampden-Turner. Schenkman Publishing Co. 434 pp. \$11.25. Paper \$4.95. The Nation. Vol. 212, No. 15, (April 12, 1971), pp. 472-474. "Radical Man is a risky book; it has many of the characteristics of what its author calls true radicalism - an authentic commitment, a willingness to confront, an attempt to bridge distances. I like that about it, and I also like its essential idealism. Hope is hard to come by these days, but the central message of Radical Man is that there is hope - that the 'human nature' which has been so evident in all the sorry history of mankind is not a fixed point but a stage beyond which we may all be capable of moving. It says, and tries to prove, that people are capable of great freedom, and that, even in these days when the moon is our official measure of forward motion, there is still a real possibility of a more profound and sensible kind of human progress."
- (66) Aries, Philippe. Centuries of Childhood. Translated from the French by Robert Baldick. New York: Alfred

A. Knopf, Inc., 1962. 447 pp. Both Reimer and Illich cite this book in their writings and speeches. "Starting in the fifteenth century, the reality and the idea of the family were to change; a slow and profound revolution, scarcely distinguished by either contemporary observers or later historians, and difficult to recognize. And yet the essential event is quite obvious: the extension of school education. We have seen how in the Middle Ages children's education was ensured by apprenticeship to adults, and that after the age of seven, children lived in families other than their own. Henceforth, on the contrary, education became increasingly a matter for the school. The school ceased to be confined to clerics and became the normal instrument of social initiation, of progress from childhood to manhood. This evolution corresponded to the pedagogues' desire for moral severity, to a concern to isolate youth from the corrupt world of adults, a determination to train it to resist adult temptations. But it also corresponded to a desire on the part of the parents to watch more closely over their children, to stay nearer to them, to avoid abandoning them even temporarily to the care of another family. The substitution of school for apprenticeship likewise reflects a rapprochement between parents and children, between the concept of the family and the concept of childhood, which had hitherto been distinct. The family centered itself on the child. The latter did not as yet live constantly with his parents: he left them for a distant school, although in the seventeenth century the advantages of a college education were disputed and many people held that education at home under a tutor was preferable. But the schoolboy's separation was not of the same character and did not last as long as that of the apprentice. The child was not as a general rule a boarder in college. He lived in a master's house or in a private lodging-house. Money and food were brought to him on market-days. The ties between the schoolboy and his family had tightened: according to Cordier's dialogues, the masters even had to intervene to prevent too many visits to the family, visits planned with the complicity of the mothers. Some schoolboys, from well-to-do homes, did not set off alone: they were accompanied by a preceptor, an older boy, or by a valet, often a foster-brother. The sentimental climate was now entirely different and closer to ours, as if the modern family originated at the same time as the school, or at least as the general habit of educating children at school....In the case of the boys, schooling was extended first of all to the middle range of the hierarchy of classes: the great families of the nobility and the artisan class remained faithful to the old system of apprenticeship, providing pages for grandees and apprentices for artisans. In the working class, the apprenticeship system would continue down to our own times.

The tours of Italy and Germany made by young nobles at the end of their studies also stemmed from the old tradition: they went to foreign court or houses to learn languages, good manners, noble sports. This custom fell into disuse in the seventeenth century, when it gave place to the academies: another example of the substitution for practical education of a more specialized and theoretical tuition The survival of the apprenticeship system at the two extremities of the social ladder did not prevent its decline; it was the school which triumphed by means of its increased numbers, its greater number of classes and its moral authority. Our modern civilization, built on a scholastic foundation, was now solidly established, and time would steadily consolidate it by prolonging and extending school life."

- (67) Barondes, Stan and Solo, Len. Teacher Drop-Out Center: A Continuing Directory of Free, Community, Innovative and Educational Organizations. According to a letter from Barondes and Solo there is a \$17.00 registration fee which covers service and publication costs for: A nationwide directory of over 1,000 innovative and alternative schools, that is regularly up-dated; descriptions of some of these schools written by administrators who would like to be contacted by TOOC people; a list of job openings; lists of films and announcements of meetings and conferences on educational alternatives. Material may be requested by writing the Teacher Drop-Out Center, Box 521, Amherst, Massachusetts 01002.
- (68) Beckwith, Burnham Putnam. The Next 500 Years. New York: Exposition Press, 1967. Beckwith's chapter on education includes the following predictions for adult education: By 2200, over 90 per cent of all adults in the world will have completed 12 years of education. By 2200, over 20 per cent of all adults in the world will have a university degree, and this proportion will thereafter rise steadily to at least 60 per cent by 2500, when the average I.Q. will be over 120. (Eugenic advance will become a major factor promoting higher education after 2100. By 2400, over one third of the world labor force will consist of professional workers (including executives), and on the average each will spend 10 to 20 per cent of his working life taking additional professional courses. Similar but less extended adult vocational study will be increasingly required of skilled and semi-skilled workers. By 2500, most children 10 to 18 years old in all countries will attend boarding school. In sum, throughout the next 500 years all workers will spend more and more of their adult life in avocational education classes. Beckwith predicts the following for youth education: "By 2000, in the U.S., nearly all 5 year olds will be in kindergarten, and by 2060 nearly all 4 year olds will be in nursery school.

By 2100, U.S. schools will be in session 260 to 300 days a year. By 2200, in the U.S., nearly all 2 and 3 year olds will attend school. By 2500, nearly all pre-school children in the world will spend over 8 hours a day, over 300 days a year, in nurseries, nursery schools, and kindergartens. Many parents will accept 16-20 hours a day care for their pre-school children by this time."

- (69) Blakely, R.J. The New Environment: Questions for Adult Educators. Syracuse, New York: Syracuse University Publications in Continuing Education, 1971. 33 pp. (This Occasional Paper may be secured for \$.50 per copy by writing to ERIC Clearinghouse on Adult Education, 107 Roney Lane, Syracuse, New York 13210).
"The Need for a New Synthesis." Repeatedly, the discussions (of the Pinebrook Seminar on Adult Education sponsored by Syracuse University) turned upon the fragmentation of the world, of nations, of individual personalities, and of aspects of life; the imbalances and disproportions; the forces that are distorting us and tearing us apart; the damage that is being done; needs that are not being met; opportunities that are being lost; the gaps of many kinds widening both within nations and between nations, and also within individual personalities; the rising expectations that are frustrated; mounting passions erupting into violence; the deepening fears that are themselves seedbeds for fear; frictions and collisions that threaten to destroy us all; the spreading 'rationality' of planning within partial areas and aspects of life that produce psychotic irrationalities between other areas and aspects of life. All this within the context of common danger, where both vulnerability and power to destroy compound, and where no effective agencies or institutions exist to care for the whole that we all compose and that embraces us all....At times the participants explicitly expressed their sense of the need for a new synthesis; at other times they implied it. At no time did they try to define what a new synthesis might be, but from various angles they indicated some of the characteristics it must have..
 ..It must be a synthesis of authentic differences, not an artificial homogenous mass. It must be achieved and treated, not imposed. It must be dynamic, not static. It must be continually provisional and constantly evolving..
 ..The new synthesis must seek to assay the full spectrum of human needs and opportunities; it must seek to minimize the necessary costs and to maximize the possible gains..
 ..The new synthesis must be based upon a recognition of both difference and commonalities, but these are not always clearly distinguishable. For example, it is possible for non-Western peoples to regard many aspects of the modern world as Westernizing influences that they should avoid or slough off. Doubtless they are correct

in some cases, but what are the cases? For example, among Western developments are the methods of science and technology, which seem destined permanently to change what might be called the cultural-genetical pool of the entire human race. For a more specific example, the abuse of drugs might be judged to be a Western phenomenon that can be shunned, but the scientific knowledge of the chemical basis of physiology and psychology is now a part of human knowledge no culture can ignore....Need for a new synthesis is indicated by the assertion of needs and aspects of life that have been neglected or ignored and can be neglected or ignored no longer. One cause of this assertion is that everywhere people are becoming aware of their conditions in a new light, or newly aware of conditions elsewhere in space and time, or aware of new possibilities, both for good and for ill. In the new environment people everywhere are becoming conscious of values they have lost or are losing, and are seeking to regain or retain them; warm human relationships; supportive contexts, in society and nature; the realization of personal and group identities; the satisfactions that come from performing needed social functions or expressing the self through creativity....This new awareness of conditions, or awareness of new conditions and new possibilities, is taking many forms - the use of drugs, the devising of new "lifestyles," the quest for more satisfactory values, activities, and goals. A new awareness is spreading that certain conditions and circumstances, long accepted as inevitable, need no longer be; that they should no longer be; that, therefore, they are wrongs --- wrongs to right, or, at least, to challenge. Within nations and between nations there are oppositions and rebellions against injustices and inequities, exploitation, neglect, and powerlessness -- above all, against powerlessness."

- (70) Blue, Adrienne and Savary, Louis M. Editors. Faces of Freedom: The Challenge of Transformation. Winona, Minnesota: St. Mary's College Press, 1969. (This compilation of photographs, poems and readings is available in paperback from the St. Mary's College Press, Christian Brothers Publications, Winona, Minnesota, 55987)

"Freedom to Wonder" by Karl Rahner
 Child-ness is openness.
 Adult child-ness is unbounded openness.
 The mature child-ness of the adult
 is bold confident openness
 in the face of the narrowing
 pseudo-experience of life.
 This amounts to the effectuating
 of a religious existence.
 In a further step,
 this adult-child openness of existence

can be experience as answered
 and kept open by an infinite
 loving self-communication of God.
 It is that kind of openness
 which theologians mean
 when they speak of the grace
 of divine sonship in the Son.
 When childhood itself attains
 the boldness to be itself
 and understands itself as unconditioned openness,
 then it is moving steadily of itself
 towards its own fulfillment in being:
 the childhood of man before God.

- (71) Boros, Ladislaus. We are Future. (Translated from the German by W. J. O'Hara) New York: Herder and Herder, 1970. 175 pp. (Available in hardbound edition for \$4.95 from Herder and Herder New York, 232 Madison Avenue, New York, New York, 10016). The child spontaneously lives in a domain where there is always going to be "more." But what is genuinely "more" in human life is divine. From the start the child is increasingly an adumbration of what is to be, an inner dynamism, foretaste, and promise. Precisely because a child is really more than it actually is yet, it reaches out to what is divine, and so can perceive significance and meaning in the world. Its eyes still see everything in an absolute light, in the light of the Absolute, in fact. A tree, a garden, a house, a pond, a candle, a piece of bread, and many other things have profound meaning for a child, and reach far down into the exemplary and symbolic depths of the world. The child still lives in a world of limitless extent because everywhere, in everything, vistas of meaning open out for him. This mysterious world - no longer perceived by us, only caught sight of once again in rare momentary recollections of childhood - wells up from within the child. The gates of reality are not yet closed to him by the practical interest of the moment, or barred by the mind's turning in on itself in reflection....To know a child, to be in reverent and loving association with him, therefore means opening oneself to the hidden abysses of reality, to what is promising and hopeful. Those who with respect and reserve protect a child, enabling him to prosper and develop, are in touch with all that is, and bring divine reality and a limitless future of hope into their own life."
- (72) The Carnegie Commission on Higher Education. Less Time, More Options: EDUCATION BEYOND THE HIGH SCHOOL. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1971. "Opportunities for higher education and the degrees it affords should be available to persons throughout their lifetimes and not just immediately after high school....More educational, and thus

career, opportunities should be available to all those who wish to study part-time or return to study later in life, particularly women and older persons....Society would gain if work and study were mixed throughout a lifetime thus reducing the sense of sharply compartmentalized roles of isolated students v. workers, and of youth v. isolated age; if more students were also workers, and if more workers could be students; if the ages mixed on the job and in the classroom in a more normally structured type of community; if all members of the community valued both study and work, and had a better chance to understand the flow of life from youth to age. Society would be more integrated across the lines that now separate students and workers, youth and age."

- (73) Cass, James. "The Crisis of Confidence -- and Beyond," Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 38, (Sept. 19, 1970), pp. 61-62. "Perhaps it is true that the schools cannot change until society itself is reformed. Perhaps the public school mystique is dead and we have, indeed, come to the end of an impossible dream. But it is also possible that the schools can play a role in that reformation of society, that we can put it all back together again and restore faith in the schools as the cornerstone of a democratic society. The task of the Seventies is to find out."
- (74) Charters, Alexander., Project Director. Toward The Educative Society. Syracuse University: Publications in Continuing Education, 1971. Copies of this book may be ordered at \$2.50 per copy from the Syracuse University Press, Box 8, University Station, Syracuse, New York 13210. Contains essays by A. Charters, R. Blakely, J.R. Lally, L. Porter, M. Lay and H. Copeland. Charters: "A major concern of Continuing Education is the encouragement of adults to learn. The task is to motivate those adults who are not learning to begin to learn and to assist those persons who are learning to continue to learn The task of the schools demands accomplishment in full recognition that learning situations for adults are not and probably cannot be mandated by law (compulsory school attendance); therefore methods of attraction and persuasion are required." Blakely: "Continuing one's education throughout life is different from "going on" to college or some other post-high-school educational institution, although, of course, it may include that, either immediately after high school or at some later time (or times). The difference lies in the core of the problem that was studied: Education is not the same as schooling. In theory the purpose of schooling is to cause education to occur within the student, but in reality education often does not occur, if education is defined as a process of self-initiated, self-directed learning. A main reason

why such education often does not occur is that to a high degree in the United States education has become equated with schooling; a process has become frozen and encapsuled in an institution. That the assumption dominates practice is attested by the judgments, general both in educational institutions and in the society, that anyone who discontinues schooling before receiving a diploma or degree is dropping out, and anyone who enrolls in educational institutions after the "normal" period is 'making up.' "

- (75) Chidsey, Jay. From a letter to John Ohliger from Rev. Jay Chidsey received March 8, 1971. "I came across a formulation earlier today you will find intriguing: Equalization occurs only after power-patterns shift. Religious equality became acceptable to the elite only after power determination had shifted to the political dimension. Political democracy became acceptable to the elite only after power determination shifted to the economic plane. The growing acceptance of a kind of economic equality in minimum income and negative income tax suggests that power determination has moved to another dimension. Perhaps technical and managerial as distinguished from entrepreneurial. Seminal, eh?"

- (76) Cirigliano, Gustavo F. J. "Fable of the Roasted Pigs," Phi Delta Kappan, Vol. 42, (November 1960). Called to our attention by CIDOC Documenta: Alternatives in Education. "One of the possible renderings of an old story on the origin of roast meat is this: Once upon a time a forest where some pigs lived caught on fire and all the pigs were roasted. Men, who at that time were in the habit of eating raw meat only, tasted the roasted pigs and found them delicious. From that time on, whenever men wanted roast pork they set a forest on fire - until, of course, they found a new method. And the story I want to tell you is the story of what happened when an attempt was made to modify The System and establish a new one....Thousands of people lived on that roast meat, and thousands more were engaged in the task of producing it; therefore it was quite clear the System simply must not fail. Yet, strangely enough, the more The System was tried on a larger and larger scale the more it proved to be a larger and larger failure....One day a fireman, in Category SW/MD/RS (south-west specialty, daily-morning, licensed for rainy summers), named John Commonsense said that the problem was really very simple and easily solved. He said that in order to solve the problem with ease only four steps need be followed: (1) the chosen pig had to be killed, (2) cleaned, (3) placed in the proper utensil, and (4) placed over the fire so that it would be cooked by the effect of the heat, and not by the effect of the flames....People kill the pigs?, exclaimed the Director of Forestation furiously.

People kill? The fire is the one to kill? Us kill? Never! The Director General of Roasting himself came to hear of this Commonsense proposal, and sent for him. He asked what Commonsense had to say about the problem, and after hearing the Four Point idea he said: What you say is absolutely right - in theory; but it won't work in practice. It's impossible. What would we do with our anemotechnicians, for instance? I don't know, answered John. Where would you put our specialized firemen? I don't know. Or the specialists in seeds, in timber? And the builders of seven-story pig pens, now equipped with new cleaning machines and automatic scenters? I don't know.

- (77) Commission on Post-Secondary Education in Ontario, Canada "Post-Secondary Education in Ontario: A Statement of Issues." Ontario. 1969. Centro Intercultural de Documentacion, Doc. A/E 71/270. (This is the so-called Wright Commission report Illich has referred to a number of times as being the first instance in which an official body stated that higher schooling requires regressive taxation.)
- (78) Cotton, Webster E. "A New Direction for Adult Education," Educational Horizons, (Summer, 1968) "We can only ask ourselves: What happened to adult education? How did this noble vision become transformed into a thriving system of adult education which is irrelevant to the fate of man in the modern world? This is a question with much broader implications than adult education. It is a dilemma that plagues our whole society. As a matter of fact, a number of social critics have directed attention to this dilemma. It has to do with the conflict between our ideals and our practice; the gap between what we say and what we do; the confusion between illusion and reality. ...In its brief sojourn on the American scene, adult education seems to have fallen prey to 'the American dilemma.' On the one hand, we have allowed our 'idealistic' intentions to be replaced by 'pragmatic' considerations. Once adult education entered the marketplace, it began to take on the trappings of the marketplace -- the overriding concern with the immediate and the practical; the emphasis on the quantitative, the number of students enrolled, the number of programs offered, and so forth; the desire to be 'successful,' defined in terms of prestige, big budgets, and so forth....However, hand in hand with this development has gone a much more sinister one. It involves the failure to recognize what has happened to adult education in the marketplace. For all practical purposes, adult 'education' has been converted into adult training -- vocational and utilitarian training. But most of us have refused to accept this reality; we have preferred the

illusion that what is carried on as 'adult education' is, in fact, adult education. We don't want to accept the fact that the noble ideals of 'the founding fathers' in adult education have 'gone down the drain'; we don't want to accept the fact that 'adult education,' as currently practiced, is irrelevant to the fate of man in the modern world. How do we go about moving adult education in a new direction? How do we make it relevant to the fate of man in the modern world? These are the big questions; these are the questions we must come to grips with. And yet, we have not even been asking these questions; let alone, trying to answer them. We have not been asking them because we have come to accept the prevailing system of 'adult education.' To ask these questions would involve calling into question the whole system. This, we dare not do. What confronts adult educators, as well as all educators, is a very real predicament. The conditions of the times seem to demand that we challenge the very system that sustains us and gives 'meaning' (of a dubious quality) to our lives. So, we arrive at a point, where most discussions of this type eventually lead, to a question of personal decision. Will the individual adult educator (or educator) have the courage to raise the questions that must be raised? And then, will he be willing to take that action which is called for? In terms of the times in which we live, this is not a duty, it is only a necessity." This article is condensed in Adult Leadership, Vol. 18, No. 3, (Sept. 1969), p. 80 (Free reprints of the full article are available by writing to Professor Webster Cotton, Education Department, California State College at Los Angeles, Los Angeles, California.)

- (79) Cox, Harvey. The Feast of Fools. New York: Harper-Colophon Books, 1969. The main theme of this book is that American culture, by absolutizing history has sown the seeds of its own despair. Cox describes an alternative to the world view that absolutizes history in terms of festivity and fantasy. By celebration (which joins festivity and fantasy) man bears witness to his faith in another order (called cosmos or divine milieu) which transcends historical time and embraces past, present and future in one event. Western man, Cox argues, has lost faith in a transcendent order and concomitantly has lost his ability to celebrate. This book is germane to a discussion of a de-schooled society because in his discussion of fantasy, Cox praises utopian thinking. The History-Absolutizing mentality regards utopian thinking as superfluous and a waste of time. The celebrating mentality revels in utopian thought. It is only through utopias that men can create alternatives, says Cox, to the dystopias of 1984 and Brave New World, etc....Anyone who

understands the dynamics of self-fulfilling prophecy can understand the importance of Cox's view. The renaissance could not have happened without the myriad acting-out utopias of medieval monasticism. Utopian thinking and acting-out about alternatives to schooling can be dignified - if it needs dignifying - by reference to Cox's work. (This item was prepared by Tim Leonard.)

- (80) Cunningham, Luvern L. "Hey, Man, You Our Principal?: Urban Education as I Saw It," Phi Delta Kappan, Vol. LI, No. 3, (Nov. 1969), pp. 123-128. From the editor's introduction: "Last May 12 principals from a Midwest city system exchanged positions briefly with a number of professors and administrators from the College of Education, Ohio State University....The dean of the OSU College of Education, who had volunteered for the exchange, was assigned to what is generally regarded as the most difficult school in the cooperating system." Cunningham: "I arrived about 7:45 a.m. I had read about the city's riots in 1966 and knew it was near here that they had started. I was aware too that this was a junior high that had been having its share of trouble....The cancer of hate is latent within the student body. You sense its power. You sense its presence and the prospect for its release at any moment. You do not know when it will burst forth and cascade around you....Systems should depress the emphasis on attendance. I would even support abandoning compulsory education for this part of the city. Emphasize programs of interest and attractiveness; de-emphasize regimentation....It is clear that we have no experts in this sort of urban education anywhere.... No one has the answer. Anyone who thinks he has is a fool....Such educational institutions are an indictment of presidents and senators; of justices and teachers; of governors and legislators. It is ludicrous the way we behave. Our pathetic politicians wailing and wringing their hands, spouting platitudes and diatribes. They say that bold acts will not find favor with unnamed constituencies. And we educators stand impotent, frightened, disheveled in the face of such tragedy."

- (81) De Beauvoir, Simone. The Ethics of Ambiguity. (Translated from the French by Bernard Frechtman.) New York: The Citadel Press, 1962. 159 pp. (paperbound edition). "Oppression divides the world into two clans: those who enlighten mankind by thrusting it ahead of itself and those who are condemned to mark time hopelessly in order merely to support the collectivity; their life is a pure repetition of mechanical gestures; their leisure is just about sufficient for them to regain their strength; the oppressor feeds himself on their transcendence and refuses to extend it by a free recognition. The oppressed has only one solution: to deny the harmony of that mankind

from which an attempt is made to exclude him, to prove that he is a man and that he is free by revolting against the tyrants. In order to prevent this revolt, one of the ruses of oppression is to camouflage itself behind a natural situation since, after all, one cannot revolt against nature."

- (82) Deloria, Vine, Jr., We Talk, You Listen: New Tribes, New Turf. New York, New York 10022: The Macmillan Co., 866 Third Avenue, 1970. 227 pp. \$5.95. Don't be misled by the fact that this book is by an American Indian who also wrote Custer Died for Your Sins. From what I have read, it seems to me that this book partakes of Illich's call for "sarcasm..to smile the social system apart." "Liberalism has lost its credibility. It no longer catches up the spirit of the times. Where the conservative is reactionary the liberal is reactive. The liberal waits for movements to occur and then either casually, self-righteously, and unconsciously buys them up or frantically tries to relate to them. The conservative views everything with suspicion. To him even the subway is subversive because it is, after all, an underground movement. The liberal waits to find out if someone else thinks the subway is good or bad, and then pounces on the most popular viewpoint, accepting it as his own and lashing out self-righteously at those who disagree with him....Indians should be ecstatic that the days of the liberal are waning. No other group has suffered as much at the hands of liberals as have Indians. Where whites 'believe' in equality and are active in civil rights when they relate to the black community, they have been 'interested' in Indians. It is rather like the way I am interested in collecting coins or someone else is interested in postage stamps....In the past, whenever an Indian did something significant, like support some white liberal's program for Indians, the liberal stated that the Indian was a 'credit to his race.' This accolade was almost comparable to being named chief -- and everyone knows how dear that is to the Indian soul....As the influence of liberals has declined, the significance of many events has also lessened. When poverty was discovered, the 'do-good' element jumped into the fray with the enthusiasm of Prince Valiant swinging his 'singing sword'. Flying to and fro from conference to conference, the liberals filled the world with the sound of airplanes, where it was formerly occupied with music. Now rumor has it that United Airlines may have to mothball half its fleet as the desperate urge to confer begins to ebb.... Because the liberal always took it upon himself to speak for and about the various racial minorities, issues which affected all racial groups were always interpreted to each group as if they shared a common burden. In fact they did share a common burden -- the liberal. His style and

language have served to divide people rather than bring them together....There is no doubt in my mind that a major crisis exists. I believe, however, that it is deeper and more profound than racism, violence, and economic deprivation. American society is undergoing a total replacement of its philosophical concepts. Words are being emptied of old meanings and new values are coming in to fill the vacuum. Racial antagonisms, inflation, ecological destruction, and power groups are all symptoms of the emergence of a new world view of man and his society. Today thought patterns are shifting from the traditional emphasis on the solitary individual to as yet unrelated definitions of man as a member of a specific group....It would appear to me that modern society has two alternatives at this point, American people are being pushed into new social forms because of the complex nature of modern communications and transportation, and the competing forms of neotribalism and neo-feudalism. The contest of the future is between a return to the castle or the tipi. The difference between the castle and the tipi is immense, yet there are such great similarities that it is difficult to distinguish between them. Each offers social identity and economic security within a definite communal system. But the leveling process of the tribal form prevents the hereditary control over a social pyramid, and the feudalistic form has the efficiency to create and control technology. Both are needed if we are to rule machines instead of submit to them....With the negation of traditional Western values the chances of a revival of Indians and Mexicans through nationalistic movements have considerably increased. Being non-Western and instinctively oriented toward group values, they can now bring their special genius to bear on their problems. But they must hurry. With militant young blacks and disenchanted white youth rapidly forming combinations on the tribal-clan basis, Indians and Mexicans may well miss the nationalistic boat. They run the risk of being the last middle-class people in the United States."

- (83) Domhoff, G. William. Who Rules America? Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, Inc., 1967. 184 pp. (Available as a Spectrum paperback at \$2.45 from Spectrum Books c/o Prentice-Hall, Inc., Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey 07632.) "Control of America's leading universities by members of the American business aristocracy is more direct than with any other institution which they control....Upper-class control of major universities is achieved through such financial support as family endowments (e.g., Duke, Stanford, Vanderbilt), personal gifts, foundation gifts, and corporate gifts, and through service on the boards of trustees. These mechanisms give the upper class con-

trol of the broad framework, the long-run goals, and the general atmosphere of the university....As might be expected, members of the American business aristocracy stressed technical and practical training in the universities they influenced, as opposed to traditional classical education....The relationship between the corporate rich and academia is best exemplified by a school such as the University of Rochester. Most of the University's board is made up of officers of such Rochester-based corporations as Eastman Kodak, Xerox, and Taylor Instrument. The chairman of the board, who is also the president of Xerox, explained the relationship as follows: 'To put it as crassly as possible, it's a matter of sheer self-interest -- dollars and cents. Xerox will live or die by technology.'

- (84) Domhoff, G. William. The Higher Circles: The Governing Class in America. New York: Random House, Inc., 1970. 367 pp. (Available at \$7.95 from Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022.) "Social mobility is not central to the study of the American upper class of the twentieth century. For students of the upper class, the findings on the small amount of movement into the upper class are interesting because they provide a basis for re-evaluating the efforts of the upper-class publicists and upper-class historians. They also cast doubt on the value of the claim that rapid social mobility has inhibited the development of class consciousness or cohesion in the highest stratum of American society.... Moderate leaders within the upper class, somewhat restrained by their more conservative brethren, have made the key decisions of the twentieth century; these moderate leaders have been helped in every area -- foreign policy, domestic policy, propaganda and espionage -- by a small number of highly respected academic experts who are situated in a handful of prestigious and richly endowed universities.... The American upper class is a governing class, by which I mean a social upper class which owns a disproportionate amount of the country's wealth, receives a disproportionate share of the country's yearly income, contributes a disproportionate number of its members to governmental bodies and decision-making groups, and dominates the policy-forming process through a variety of means....The governing class manifests itself through a power elite which is its operating arm."

- (85) Domhoff, G. William and Hoyt B. Ballard, editors. C. Wright Mills and The Power Elite. Boston: Beacon Press, 1968. 278 pp. This compilation contains two essays on Mills as a man and as a sociologist; eleven critiques of The Power Elite by such "Liberal," "Radical," or "High-brow" critics as Talcott Parsons, A.A. Berle, Jr., Robert S. Lynd, Herbert Aptheker, Richard Rovere, and

Daniel Bell; Mills' own reply to reviews of his book; and a final essay by Domhoff "to provide comment on the later reviews (not covered by Mills), and to survey the discussion from a perspective of ten years and recent research." Domhoff concludes: "With or without alterations and qualifications, The Power Elite stands as tall in the light of recent events as it did in 1956 when it crashed in on the Great American Celebration with its detailed description and provocative indictment of the structure of power in modern America. Not only did it present a new conception of how the United States is ruled, but it forced pluralists and Marxists to rethink, make explicit, and defend their own positions. It is a landmark of political sociology that will be read with more than mere historical interest for many years to come, a beacon to the intellectual craftsmen on whom Mills placed his hopes for the rational and humane world he passionately sought."

- (86) Douglas, William O. Points of Rebellion. New York: Vintage Books, 1970. 97 pp. (Paperback edition available at \$1.95 from Vintage Books, c/o Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022.) The universities should be completely freed from CIA and from Pentagon control, through grants of money or otherwise. Faculties and students should have the basic controls so that the university will be a revolutionary force that helps shape the restructuring of society. A university should not be an adjunct of business, nor of the military, nor of government. Its curriculum should teach change, not the status quo. Then, the dialogue between the people and the powers-that-be can start; and it may possibly keep us all from being victims of the corporate state."

- (87) Duberman, Martin. "An Experiment in Education," in The Uncompleted Past, by Martin Duberman. New York: Random House, 1969. 374 pp. (Available at \$7.95 from Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022). "The entire superstructure of authoritarian control in our schools must give way if we are to enable people to assume responsibility for and to take pleasure in their own lives. We cannot expect aliveness and involvement when we are busy inculcating docility and compliance. In this regard, the false distinctions that separate student from teacher must be broken down. What do we think titles like 'professor,' 'sir,' or 'mister' achieve? Perhaps the illusion of respect, but certainly not its reality....The simple dualism which pretends that education is concerned solely with 'informing the mind,' and therapy with 'understanding the emotions' falsifies our everyday experience. No one actually functions on the basis of such neat categories; our emotions always color our intellectual

views, and our minds are continually 'ordering' our emotional responses....(I continue to use outmoded, dualistic terminology like intellectual and emotional because more accurate vocabulary is not yet available.)"

- (88) Duberman, Martin. "Review of Silberman's 'Crisis in the Classroom,'" The New York Times Book Review, (Sept. 20, 1970), pp. 9+. "His book is a formidable indictment of all levels of education in this country....It is Silberman who has reminded us that whenever anyone discusses the 'aims of education,' he is inescapably dealing in the basic question, What kind of human beings and what kind of society do we want to produce....Men like Neill and Holt have made more of an effort than Silberman to outline the premises and examine the ramifications of the particular model of human behavior implicit in their work. Most of Silberman's energies have gone instead to detailing the current horrors of the schools. And on that level, no book has done a better job."
- (89) "Educators 'Stewards of Future,'" Citizen Journal. Columbus, Ohio, February 22, 1971. "Novice G. Fawcett, president of Ohio State University, said Sunday school administrators 'need to recover both confidence and authority' if they are to be responsible 'for the quality of life on this earth.'" "The slow, tortuous growth-process of public education has brought us to the greatest and most demanding undertaking ever attempted by an organized society - responsibility for the quality of life on this earth," he said. "In order to shoulder so Herculean a task, administrators need to recover both confidence and authority. And if one makes rational allowance for the fallibility of human beings, whatever the job they attempt, there is in past and present performance more than enough justification for the resumption of both.'" "The OSU president said 'our authority must find a convincing image, and it must be exercised without authoritarianism.'"
- (90) Eller, Vernard. The Mad Morality or The Ten Commandments Revisited. New York: Abingdon Press, 1970. Comments by Eller, Professor of Religion at La Verne College, on the Ten Commandments using as illustrations cartoons from Mad Magazine. The soft cover book sells for \$2.79. "I. YOU SHALL HAVE NO OTHER GODS BESIDES ME....the commandment suggests, free men will take care that their worship is devoted solely to the one God Yahweh, the God of Freedom. To share his worship with any other god or god-substitute is to court enslavement, because none of them are big enough and great enough and real enough to merit or sustain one's allegiance and commitment of life."

- (91) Farber, Jerry. The Student as Nigger. New York: Pocket Books, 1969. 142 pp. (Paperback available at \$1.10 from Pocket Books, 1 West 39th Street, New York, New York 10018.) According to the author the title essay of this book of essays has been reprinted in about 500 publications, "two high-school teachers in the Los Angeles area were fired on the spot for reading it to their classes, "campus editors who have reprinted it have routinely been called on the administration carpet," but "I have received scarcely any criticism from students on the article." "Student's are society's slaves and teachers are no more than overseers. It's a mistake to get hung up exclusively in a struggle against teachers just as it's a mistake to let one's anger toward ghetto cops obscure the larger threat of the racist society that pays their salary and buys their bullets....Democracy in school doesn't mean that we vote on what's true; it means that education isn't anything which is done to somebody.... Learning isn't a duty that we must be flogged into performing; it's our birthright, our very human specialty and joy. Places to learn are everywhere. So are reasons to learn. All we need, occasionally, is a little help from our friends....There is a kind of castration that goes on in schools. It begins before school years with parents' first encroachments on their children's free unashamed sexuality and continues right up to the day when they hand you your doctoral diploma with a bleeding shriveled pair of testicles stapled to the parchment.... What's missing, from kindergarten to graduate school, is honest recognition of what's actually happening -- turned-on awareness of hairy goodies underneath the pettipants, the chinos and the flannels. It's not that sex needs to be pushed in school; sex is push enough. But we should let it be, where it is and like it is. I don't insist that ladies in junior high school lovingly caress their students' cocks (someday maybe); however, it is reasonable to ask that the ladies don't, by example and stricture, teach their students to pretend those cocks aren't there. As things stand now, students are psychically castrated or spayed -- and for the very same reason that black men are castrated in Georgia: because they're a threat."
- (91a) Fawcett, Novice G. "Address by Dr. Novice G. Fawcett, President, Ohio State University." Congressional Record - Senate. March 30, 1971, S4100. "Learning will extend itself over the entire life span, from infancy to final ending. It will go into the home, and the vast reaches of leisure, and the islands of industry - a union already solidified, and symbolized, by our Center For Tomorrow."

Interspersed with periods of rest, travel, work, and other pursuits we do not yet know, it will be continuous. Education will be both a moving target and a moveable feast. In an unrelenting search for truth, it must be anchored to the immutable verity which Adlai Stevenson phrased in these words: We travel together, passengers on a little spaceship, dependent on its vulnerable reserve of air and soil. We are all committed for our safety to its security and peace, and preserved from annihilation only by the care, the work, and the love we give our fragile craft."

- (92) Fischer, John H. "Who Needs Schools?" Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 38, (Sept. 19, 1970), pp. 78-79+. Fischer is president of Teachers College, Columbia University. "The issue whether schools should be publicly or privately controlled, competitive or monopolistic, is overshadowed, however, by a prior and more basic question: Are they necessary? While a flat negative answer would be as irresponsible as it would be shocking to most people, the question cannot be dismissed out of hand....The radical question must be raised, for it deserves a well-considered response."
- (93) Friedrich, Carl J. The New Image of the Common Man. Boston: Beacon Press, 1950. 382 pp. "In the United States the intelligentsia, whether benevolent or malevolent, continue to think of 'the masses' or at any rate of 'the other fellow' when they speak of the common man Time and again I have had to point out that 'the common man is you and me' -- that the common man is 'everyman' when not concerned with his specialty.... Politics in a democracy is adult education, at least half the time. We may not think of it that way, but the educational value of a free discussion of public affairs is nevertheless one of the most important arguments in favor of democracy. John Stuart Mill put it very well in his Representative Government. Arguing against the Greek philosophers, especially Plato, he pointed out that the notion of an ideal king is bad, because the more benevolent his rule, the more enervating its effect in the long run. 'Their minds are formed by, and consenting to, this abdication of their own energies.' It is this active participation which makes of democratic politics a school for adults. How can this participation be elicited? How can we rouse ourselves to facing the same issues which the schools are groping toward in their work with children?"
- (94) Fromm, Erich. The Revolution of Hope: Toward a Humanized Technology. New York: Bantam Books, Inc., 1968. 179 pp. (Available in paperback at 95 cents from Bantam Books, Inc., 666 Fifth Avenue, New York, New York 10019 or in

hardback from Harper and Row Publishers, Inc., 49 E. 33rd St., New York, New York 10016.) "The conclusion seems unavoidable that the ideas of activation, responsibility, participation -- that is, of the humanization of technological society -- can find full expression only in a movement which is not bureaucratic, not connected with political machines, and which is the result of active and imaginative efforts by those who share the same aims. Such a movement itself, in its organization and method, would be expressive of the aim to which it is devoted: to educate its members for the new kind of society in the process of striving for it."

- (95) Fromm, Erich. The Sane Society. New York: Rinehart & Co., Inc., 1955. 370 pp. "Why should society feel responsible only for the education of children, and not for the education of all adults at every age? Actually, as Alvin Johnson has pointed out so convincingly, the age between six and eighteen is not by far as suitable as is generally assumed. It is, of course, the best age to learn the three R's, and languages, but undoubtedly the understanding of history, philosophy, religion, literature, psychology, etcetera, is limited at this early age, and in fact, even around twenty, at which age these subjects are taught in college, is not ideal. In many instances to really understand the problems in these fields, a person must have had a great deal more experience in living than he has had at college age. For many people the age of thirty or forty is much more appropriate for learning -- in the sense of understanding rather than memorizing -- than school or college age, and in many instances the general interest is also greater at the later age than at the stormy period of youth. It is around this age also at which a person should be free to change his occupation completely, and hence to have a chance to study again, the same chance which today we permit only our youngsters. A sane society must provide possibilities for adult education, much as it provides today for the schooling of children. This principle finds expression today in the increasing number of adult-education courses, but all these private arrangements encompass only a small segment of the population, and the principle needs to be applied to the population as a whole."
- (96) Gobel, Frank. The Third Force: The Psychology of Abraham Maslow. New York: Grossman Publishers, 1970. 201 pp. \$7.95. "Third Force Psychology is the name Dr. Maslow gave to the movement he fathered, a serious and rapidly growing movement that is challenging the most basic precept on which the study of man has been based for a century. It rejects Freud's dictatorship of the subconscious and the mechanistic world of the Behaviorists."

In their stead, it proposes a new philosophy of man, an optimistic human awareness that sets man free to be man, to create and grow, to control his choices and goals... The Third Force is the first book to present Maslow's theories to the layman. In addition to explaining the new philosophy of man, it contains a large section of case studies, showing the application of Third Force theories to business and industry, psychotherapy, community life, and schools. In all, it is a lucid and intelligent guide to one of the crucial ideas of our time."

- (97) Goodman, Paul. Compulsory Mis-education and The Community of Scholars. New York: Vintage Books, 1964. 339 pp. (Paperback available at \$1.95 from Vintage Books, c/o Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022). "The dominance of the present school auspices prevents any new thinking about education, although we face unprecedented conditions.... The immediate future of our country seems to me to have two looming prospects, both gloomy. If the powers-that-be proceed as stupidly, timidly, and 'politically' as they have been doing, there will be a bad breakdown and the upsurge of a know-nothing fascism of the right. Incidentally, let me say that I am profoundly unimpressed by our so-called educational system when, as has happened, Governor Wallace comes from the South as a candidate in Northern states and receives his highest number of votes (in some places a majority) in suburbs that have had the most years of schooling, more than 16. The other prospect -- which to be frank, seems to me to be the goal of the school-monks themselves -- is a progressive regimentation and brainwashing, on scientific principles, directly toward a fascism-of-the-center, 1984. Certainly this is not anybody's deliberate purpose; but given the maturing of automation, and the present dominance of the automating spirit in schooling, so that all of life becomes geared to the automatic system, that is where we will land."
- (98) Goodman, Paul. "High School is Too Much." Psychology Today. Volume 4, Number 5, (October 1970), pp. 25, 26, 33. "In my opinion, the majority of so-called students in college and high schools do not want to be there and ought not to be. An academic environment is not the appropriate means of education for most young people, including most of the bright....If the schools were truly voluntary associations, the disorders would never occur or would be immediately quelled by the members who would protect what they love....My bias is that 'teaching' is largely a delusion. People do learn by practice, but not much by academic exercises in an academic setting The school system has taken over a vast part of the

educational functions of society, designating preschool toys from age two, and training for every occupation as well as citizenship, sexuality and the humanities. Yet with trivial exceptions, what we mean by school - a special place, a curriculum, departments, texts, lessons, scheduled periods marked by bells, specialist teachers, examinations and graded promotions - is a sociological invention of some Irish monks in the Seventh Century to bring a bit of Rome to wild shepherds. It is an amazing success story."

- (99) Gouldner, Alvin W. "The Gift Relationship." The New York Times Book Review. (March 21, 1971), pp. 2, 20. (A review by Gouldner of The Gift Relationship by Richard M. Titmuss. 339 pp. New York: Pantheon Books, \$6.95.) "The commercialization of human blood, then, derives not from some thoughtless inadvertence of social policy, but from the bent commitment of our type of industrial society to treat human labor as akin to other market commodities. If we can and do buy and sell a man's lifetime and energies, if we have consented to treat much of existence as a commodity, we must not be surprised if men do not boggle at trafficking in blood. The commercialization of blood tokens the extent to which the most sacred presuppositions of our culture have been penetrated and distorted by the norms of venality....Titmuss does not seem very hopeful that, once instituted, commercialization can be replaced by a return to voluntary donations. For those nations who have taken the road to commercialized blood banks, the only practical hope seems to be to bring them under state control and to forbid such commercialization by law. In the end, then, he seems to tell us that our only practical alternative is a choice between the commercial vampire and the bureaucratic vampire. If one bears in mind that the problem of distributing blood is essentially akin to most others bearing on the public welfare, it would appear that our future is to be shaped by a joyless necessity."
- (100) Greeley, Andrew M. A Future To Hope In. Garden City, New York: Doubleday and Company, Inc., 1969. 236 pp. (Paperback edition available for \$1.25 from Image Books, a division of Doubleday and Company.) "It is pretty hard to grow up in American society without having feelings of inadequacy and failure....In American society, also, competitiveness is so intense that most young people are trained for competition early in life. Love is given or withheld, depending on how successful the child is in the competitive evaluation. Comparisons begin with one's weight at birth and proceed on to the size of one's funeral, with such high points in between as one's first step, the mastery of toilet habits, marks in grammar school, social success in high school, the score of the National Merit or College Board or Graduate Record exams, the size of one's wedding, the importance of one's job, the success

of one's marriage, the size of one's car, the material of one's spouse's coat, and the neighborhood in which one lives. Thus the typical middle-class American adolescent arrives at the big leap toward adulthood with a checkered record of success and failure, in most cases hardly sufficient to assure his own dignity or worth. If the adolescent is to become an adult 'self,' he must acquire morality, playfulness, self-respect, faith, creativity, and courage."

- (101) Gross, Beatrice and Ronald, Editors. Radical School Reform. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1969. (\$7.95 in hardback) Contains articles by Kozol, Holt, Goodman and 23 others. From the introduction: "We have bungled badly in education. Not merely in the ways noted by most school critics: too little money for education, outdated curricula, poorly trained teachers. But in more fundamental ways. It isn't just that our schools fail to achieve their stated purposes, that they are not the exalted places their proponents proclaim. Rather, many are not even decent places for our children to be. They damage, they thwart, they stifle children's natural capacity to learn and grow healthily. To use Jonathan Kozol's frightening but necessary metaphor: they destroy the minds and hearts of our children."
- (102) Hampden-Turner, Charles. Radical Man. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Schenkman Publishing Company, 1970. 433 pp. "If (student) radicals seem to hate everything America represents, at least part of the reason is that freedom, democracy, love of neighbor and the appreciation of heritage must be rediscovered in action, not learnt by rote. Genuinely free men create their own heritage, they doubt received wisdoms until these are proved in situ. There is an absurd contradiction in being lectured about freedom while sitting in straight rows and taking feverish notes. There are similar contradictions in the social sciences which know about people without knowing them, because research is split from teaching, perception is split from action, truth is split from communicability, and intellect is split from emotional experience. No wonder the Berkeley campus exploded shortly after students were told that 'Free Speech' was permitted but not if it had any consequences in political action beyond the campus. Academic traditions and administrative rules fragment the developmental cycle into isolated segments. This is psychological and verbal violence at its worst."
- (103) Huberman, Michael. "Reflections on the democratization of secondary and higher education." In: THE TIMES EDUCATIONAL SUPPLEMENT, London, Sept. 21, 1970. p. 10. "At a time when the new wave of educational psychologists, inspired

by Bruner and Inhelder, can show that any concept can be taught at any age, and when primary and secondary school-children are working in areas which only a few years ago were confined to higher education, the argument cannot long persist - to quote Charity James - that knowledge will turn to mud if it is too broadly spread."

- (104) Huntzinger, Howard. "Pemberton Urges Law Lowering School Age," The Columbus Dispatch (January 21, 1971). Columbus, Ohio. "State Rep. Mack Pemberton, R-Columbus, is proposing legislation that would make attendance at school a privilege and not a requirement for students 14 and older. The veteran school teacher, principal, coach and administrator admitted Thursday the purpose of his bill is to expel troublemakers and allow them to learn how hard life can be without an education. 'Teachers now are spending 95 per cent of their time on 5 per cent of the students,' Pemberton stated. 'This small percentage of students who make themselves a nuisance hope to get kicked out of school,' he continued. 'My bill would help them accomplish their mission. My bill would let them go out and get some sense. They then might wake up and go back to school after they find out how unqualified they are for jobs.' Pemberton said his bill would do away with work permits which now enable a student 16 or older to leave school. 'Work permits are a farce,' he said. The lawmaker said the problem now is that students are required to stay in school until they are 18 unless they have a work permit. 'If they drop out for a year or two at 16 to 18,' he said 'they are reluctant to return to school even if they feel it is advisable. This is because they are so much older than the other students.' However, Pemberton said he believes 14 to 15-year-olds would 'see the light' and return to school and not have the age embarrassment. 'My proposal would take away an issue from the problem students,' he continued. 'They balk because school is a requirement. They don't want to be forced to do something.' Pemberton contended the child that lacks the proper motivation and attitude is wasting not only his own time but that of the teacher and other students."

- (105) Hutchins, Robert M. The Learning Society. New York: Frederick A. Praeger, Publishers, 1968. 142 pp. (Paperback edition available at \$1.25 from Mentor Books c/o New American Library, 1301 Avenue of the Americas, New York, New York 10019.) "Is it possible to go further and foresee the learning society? This would be one that, in addition to offering part-time adult education to every man and woman at every stage of grown-up life, had succeeded in transforming its values in such a way that learning, fulfillment, becoming human, had become its

aims and all its institutions were directed to this end. This is what the Athenians did....They did not have much of an educational system. But they have been educators of the human race. In Athens, education was not a segregated activity, conducted for certain hours, in certain places, at a certain time of life. It was the aim of the society. The city educated the man. The Athenian was educated by the culture, by paideia. This was made possible by slavery. The Athenian citizen had leisure; the Greek word for leisure is the origin of our word for school. The Athenian was expected to turn his free time into leisure, into learning how to govern himself and his community. Slavery gave him the free time Machines can do for every modern man what slavery did for the fortunate few in Athens. The vision of the learning society, or, as Sir Julian Huxley has put it, the fulfillment society, can be realized. A world community learning to be civilized, learning to be human, is at last a possibility. Education may come into its own."

- (106) Keller, George C. "The Cost -- and Price -- of Education," Nation, Vol. 210, No. 8, (March 2, 1970), pp. 242-244. As education has moved to stage center, as it has become instrumental to economic and military supremacy, the cry rises that it is being distorted and shackled. Has education become increasingly an enterprise dedicated to the production of 'useful' knowledge and of specialized 'brainpower'? Is the very nature of 'rationality' being subtly redefined -- from a process of raising disturbing, complicated, interrelated questions about the ingredients of a good life and a just society to one of refining the data and methods of particular fields, whose place and aims are largely unexamined and whose results for society are unmonitored?"
- (107) Keubler, Joseph E. "AT&T Chief at Akron U: Cut Education Cost Spiral," Akron Beacon Journal, January 1971. A top-ranking businessman is convinced it is time for Americans to take a look at the ever soaring sums being spent for education....H. I. Romnes, chairman of American Telephone and Telegraph Company told an Akron audience Thursday he raised this question because 'we are moving into an era of limited resources and increasingly urgent debate as to how this money ought to be allocated....In turning to education costs, he said if his information is correct, U.S. spending for education has grown at a compound annual rate of more than 13 pct. over the past 10 years and now stands at \$70 billion....Outlays for higher education account for about 27 pct of that total and have been rising at a rate of more than 14 pct.' 'How long can growth rates like these be sustained?' he asked. 'How

long SHOULD they be sustained?"

- (108) Knowles, Malcolm S. "An Experiment with Group Self-Directed Learning: The Learning-Teaching Team," in The Modern Practice of Adult Education: Andragogy Versus Pedagogy. By Malcolm Knowles. New York: Association Press, 1970. Also in The Changing College Classroom. Edited by Philip Runkel, Roger Harrison, and Margaret Runkel. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1969. (The Knowles book can be ordered at \$12.95 from Association Press, 291 Broadway, New York, New York 10007.) "(An) observation that is supported by a large volume of evaluative statements obtained from students at the completion of their degree programs (using this approach) is that for most students learning to become self-directed learners is a euphoric, ego-expanding experience. They report, that when they came into the program, they viewed education as a chore, a self-degrading necessity, or, at best, a mostly irrelevant means for gaining a status-conferring degree. But when they really mastered the art of self-directed and collaborative learning, education became a thing of beauty, an aesthetic experience, a life-enhancing activity."

- (109) Knowles, Malcolm. From a transcription of a Video-tape Presentation to a conference on mass media in university adult education held by UCLA Extension, March 23, 1970. "The first proposition I would like to make is that in the next decade or two, there will be such a tremendous expansion of adult educational activities that existing resources and facilities cannot possibly meet the need that will emerge. There isn't any question in my mind that by 1980 it will be an accepted fact of life in our culture that adults will attend educational institutions, engaging in educational activities, as it is now accented that all children will engage in educational experiences. Adult education will become, I am very confident, as much a part of the day in day out existence of adults as it has been in the past generations for children. So we are in for a massive expansion in which we are simply going to have to make better use of the mass media and other technological devices than we ever have in the past."

- (110) Kulich, Jindra. An Historical Overview of the Adult Self-Learner. Vancouver 8, British Columbia, Canada: University Extension, University of British Columbia, 1970. 11 pp. mimeographed. EDRS Order No. ED 037 648 MF \$.65 HC \$3.29 Available from the ERIC Document Reproduction Service, P.O. Drawer O, Bethesda, Md. 20014. "One can say, generally, that up to the fairly recent wide-spread and readily available schooling for everybody, self-education was the prime way for man to cope with the world

around him....With the introduction of free compulsory education for children, following the industrial revolution, many educators have forgotten the need of the adult to continue on learning. Although the working man struggling for his place in the industrial society and the North American self-made man provide us with ample examples of the self-educated adult....If we search for support for the claim of man's ability as a self-learner, we can find it already with the Greek philosophers. Socrates spoke about the wise as those who have mastered self-control, and declared himself as a self-learner who is not ashamed to learn from everyone around him. Plato saw as the ultimate goal of education of young the ability of the adult for self-education....On this continent, Benjamin Franklin can be seen as one of the early leaders in self-education. His Autobiography is not only a gospel of the materially successful self-made man; it also points out the way to self-education through reading and discussion....Life-long integrated learning can succeed only if we mobilize the human ability to learn throughout life in a systematic way. Independent study, and the self-learning adult, will have to form a considerable part of this integrated, life-long system of education."

- (111) Laing, R.D. Knots. New York: Pantheon Books, 1970.
 "They are playing a game. They are playing at not playing a game. If I show them I see they are, I shall break the rules and they will punish me. I must play their game, of not seeing I see the game."

- (112) Lauter, Paul and Florence Howe. "How the School System is Rigged for Failure," New York Review of Books, Vol. 14, No. 12, (June 18, 1970), pp. 14-21. "Are the schools 'failures'? If they do not accomplish the goals which educators have laid out for them, it may well be that all they need -- as the CED, Congress, and Fantini and Weinstein urge -- is more money, more innovation, more machines, more specialization. It may also be, however, that the stated goals of American education are deceptive and irrelevant ones, that their grand rhetoric clouds the character and social objectives of the schools What if the apparent 'failures' of the American educational system have served necessary functions in American society? Perhaps the schools, like almost all other American institutions, have been very, indeed horrifyingly, successful....In their conscious attempt to impose personal habits of restraint, self-control, diligence, promptness, and sobriety on their students, particularly those from 'loose,' 'shiftless' (or 'disadvantaged') backgrounds, schoolmen served the desires of business for a disciplined and acquiescent work force."

- (113) Leggett, Stanton. "Thirteen Imperatives for Boards in

the Seventies," American School Board Journal, (October 1970). When Rep. Laurence J. Burton (Utah) inserted this article in the Congressional Record for Oct. 14, 1970 (p. E9429) he stated "Mr. Stanton Leggett, one of America's foremost educational consultants, outlines some of the new thoughts boardmen will have to have, and the new actions they will have to take -- if public education that is really free is to have a chance of survival in the seventies." Leggett: "5. The old must listen to the young. If the language is strident, it is, in part, because the issues are great....7. Watch the nonschool grow and grow and grow....13. The schools had better do more than just survive."

- (114) Leonard, George B. Education and Ecstasy. New York: Delacorte Press, 1968. 237 pp. "The idea of education as the most effective human change agent is by no means new. But I have tried to broaden and simplify education's definition, to expand its domain, to link it with the new technology and to alter the relationship between educator and learner. As a chief ingredient in all this, as well as an alternative to the old reinforcers, I have named "ecstasy" - joy, ananda, the ultimate delight.... Our society knows little about this ingredient. In fact, every civilization in our direct lineage has tended to fear and shun it as a threat to reason and order. In a sense, they have been right. It is hard to imagine a more revolutionary statement for us than 'The natural condition of the human organism is joy.' For, if this is true, we are being daily cheated, and perhaps the social system that so ruthlessly steals our birthright should be overthrown....How many of us can live through three or four utterly joyful days without feeling, shortly afterwards, that our plane will crash or that we shall be struck with lightning? It is deeply embedded, this societal teaching. And when a highly visible segment of our young people, sometimes through shortsighted means, devotes all its days and nights to the pursuit of joy, how many of us do not feel deeply threatened? Joy does threaten things-as-they-are. Ecstasy, like nuclear energy, is dangerous. The only thing that may turn out to be more dangerous is shunning it and clinging to the old ways that clearly are dragging us toward destruction."
- (115) Levy, Sidney. The Meaning of Work. Chicago: The Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults, 1963. 17 pp. \$2.00 Syracuse University Press, Box 8 University Station, Syracuse, New York 13210. "In the past, work has been the great necessity. It is clearly less so now for great numbers of people in this country, making the discovery of oneself through non-work activities more possible than before. Work-pride may well be diminished even for those still devoted to it; but what it demands

may well become more complex. It is perhaps paradoxical, then, that non-work, by providing the greatest opportunities for those elements of spontaneity and imagination that make for fuller flowering and fruition of individuality - if they are seized! - may contribute the most to the kind of self-love that is a deep aspect of being a good and successful worker."

- (116) Liveright, A.A., editor. Occasional Paper II: The Concept of Lifelong Integrated Learning, "Education Permanente," and Some Implications for University Adult Education. 60 pp. Excerpts from working papers, presentations and discussions at a seminar on Education Permanente convened by the International Congress of University Adult Education at the Washington Square Campus of New York University on August 5th to 7th, 1967. (For information on price, availability, and ordering write to International Congress of University Adult Education, Mr. William McCallion, Chairman, McMaster University, Hamilton, Ontario, Canada.) Contributors include W.J. McCallion, J. Roby Kidd, John Walker Powell, Robert Theobald, Bertrand Schwartz, Peter E. Siegle, T.C. Lai, Ayo Ogunshye, Sidney Raybould, and Ahmad Abd Al-Halim. J. Roby Kidd: "Am I totally mad to dream about a single organization of teachers, teachers of all ages, of all subjects, full and part-time, united around their common allegiance to learning? Mad or not I am willing to take a small wager that it will come before the end of this century. And when it does, teachers will begin to have and to deserve the strength and power and responsibility that is demanded by their higher calling."
- (117) Maheu, Rene. "Toward an Education Permanente," Convergence, Vol. 1, No. 1, (1968). (Original article in French. An English translation is available without charge by writing to Convergence, P.O. Box 250, Station F, Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada.) "Personally, I am convinced that the time has come for a radical re-examination of the contents, the methods, and the apparatus of education....For the first time in history it is now possible to tackle the problem of education and endeavour to find solutions on a world-wide scale. We must not hesitate, then, to put forward new and bold theories....The development of adult education is undoubtedly hampered by the difficulties of life, weariness and attrition, and budgetary restrictions. But the most serious obstacles are of a subjective nature: skepticism and intellectual sloth, supported by the routine of institutions. Finally, it is only when adult education becomes for every man both a right and an urge, a duty and a source of pleasure, that it will at last become firmly rooted in the beliefs of the individual and appear as it really is: the most complete and concrete answer to man's material needs and spiritual aspirations."

Maheu is Director General of UNESCO.

- (118) Marien, Michael. Essential Reading For The Future Of Education: A Selected and Critically Annotated Bibliography. Syracuse, New York: Educational Policy Research Center, 1971. Copies are available at \$1.50 from EPRC Publications, Educational Policy Research Center, 1206 Harrison Street, Syracuse, New York 13210. Make checks payable to: Syracuse University Research Corporation. There are 200 items on such themes as methodology, general trends and descriptive futures, and educational policy proposals.
- (119) Marin, Peter. "Children of the Apocalypse," Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 38, (Sept. 19, 1970), pp. 71-73+. "What sense can one make of the public schools? They are stiff, unyielding, microcosmic versions of a world that has already disappeared. They are, after all, the state's schools, they do the state's work, and their purpose is the preservation of things as they were. Their means are the isolation of ego and the deflection of energy. Their main structural function is to produce in the young a self-delusive 'independence' -- a system of false consciousness and need that actually renders them dependent on institutions and the state. Their corrosive role-playing and demand systems are so extensive, so profound, that nothing really human shows through -- and when it does, it appears only as frustration, exhaustion, and anger. That, of course, is the real outrage of the schools: their systematic corruption of the relations of persons. Where they should be comrades, allies, equals, and even lovers, the public schools make them 'teacher' and 'student' -- replaceable units in a mechanical ritual that passes on, in the name of education, an 'emotional plague'; a kind of ego and personality that has been so weakened, so often denied the experience of community or solitude, that we no longer understand quite what these things are or how to achieve them....The most human acts I have ever found in our colleges and high schools are the ones most discouraged, the surreptitious sexuality between teachers and students. Although they were almost always cramped and totally exploitative, they were at least some kind of private touch."
- (120) Markmann, Charles Lam. The Noblest Cry: A History of the American Civil Liberties Union. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1965. "Though the ACLU never accepted the facts that unions had always relied as much as employers on violence and that labor had now won as unbalanced a domination as management had formerly held, it was keenly aware of abuses within unions, and it hoped to see them become miniature models for a free society (which, of

course, is always a contradiction in terms."

- (121) Masland, Grant. "When the Masses Control the Media," Center Report, IV, 1 (February 1971). A Center Occasional Paper is published five times annually, December, February, April, June, and October, by the Fund for the Republic, Inc., 2056 Eucalyptus Hill Road, Santa Barbara, California 93193; an educational non-profit organization. "The next few years will see more and more people using electronic tools such as the portable video-tape recorder, the cassette tape recorder, FM radio and cable television to bring understanding among members of communities leading to the kind of harmony we have not yet known. By looking at some examples of the change in the uses of television we are beginning to understand what is going to happen in ever-widening and interlocking circles in the Seventies.. ..I recently gave a portable video-tape recorder to a group of students at Pomona (Calif.) high school to see what would happen. Within ten minutes four boys had figured out how the thirty-pound machine worked. They reenacted a few television commercials and then decided to do their own thing. For forty minutes the TV team ranged around the school. They found the football coach and asked him 'what makes a man?' Then they taped some 'man-in-the-street' interviews with unusually shy students who opened up to them. Next they entered the Faculty Lounge and began video-taping a discussion with some teachers. What happened next was the high point of their 'production.' A male member of the faculty burst into the lounge and shouted, 'What the hell are you long-hairs doing in here? Get out!' He then got out himself, closely followed by the TV team with their VTR aimed at him. Outside the lounge the teacher continued his tirade, evading polite entreaties by the boys to 'just tell us what's wrong.' Then the boys returned with loaded tape to the classroom to put it into the playback unit of the television set. No sooner had the playback begun than the assistant principal entered the room and asked who had allowed the students to use the VTR and why the students had chosen to irritate the faculty with it. 'Just look at the tape, please,' one of the boys said. The assistant principal watched for half an hour. At the end he made statements to ameliorate the situation and the boys expressed sympathy for his position. One later went to his office to apologize for not wearing shoes. Thus, within an hour, four youths had learned to operate video-tape equipment, sought out subjects of interest to the class, explored their environment, and, with the assistant principal, began to comprehend another level of social reality."

- (122) McCarthy, Colleen. "Dissertation Proposal." December, 1970. 12 pp. mimeographed. (For availability of this

document write to Miss McCarthy at the address on the last page of this bibliography.) "Amidst current discussions on educational forecasting, concepts of process and integrated life-long learning, there is a noteworthy absence of dialogue on the emergence of compulsory adult education. From a hasty glance at activities on the national scene, it is apparent that divers 'compulsory' programs are in full-scale operation and a cursory examination of statements made by leading adult educators suggests that more will be on their way....The jejune usage of the word 'voluntary' calls for re-evaluation in light of the evolutionary phenomenon of adult education. One objective of this dissertation then is to look at the field of adult education through the prism of the voluntary-compulsory dynamic, in an attempt to provide new meaning, new connectives to the field. By constructing a typology of educational imperatives which will provide the integrative force to the examination, I endeavor to establish a multi-dimensional theoretical base for the study of adult education, which will thrust new shafts into the fabric of program planning, methodology, curriculum development, administration and research design."

- (123) McGhee, Paul. The Learning Society. Chicago: Center for the Study of Liberal Education for Adults, 1959. 14pp. mimeographed. (An Address by the late Dean of the Division of General Education, New York University at Michigan State University-Oakland on April 18, 1959.) "Questions in education now trumpeted through the land as of utmost importance will fade away in a very few years in the face of an inexorable pattern of living which requires an education more embracing than any yet known, for more people than ever before, and from cradle-to-the-grave....Yes, there is some reason to think that we are developing a 'Learning Society.' Less frequently now, does a man of any intelligence speak of education as an experience or discipline he has had. It seems clear, too, that with all the pressures and stresses of our day, more status is being conferred on teachers, and more status on learning, despite temporary setbacks."
- (124) Mills, C. Wright. "Mass Society and Liberal Education," in Power, Politics and People: The Collected Essays of C. Wright Mills. Edited by Irving Louis Horowitz. New York: Ballantine Books, 1963. (Several hardback and paperback editions of the book have been printed. The essay itself is available at \$3.00 as an Out-of-Print CSLEA publication, Notes and Essays #9, from University Microfilms Library Services, Ann Arbor, Michigan 48106.) "I doubt that education, for adults or for adolescents, is the strategic factor in the building of a democratic polity. I think it is in the picture and must be, but given its present personnel and administration, and its

generally powerless position among other politically relevant organizations, it cannot and will not get the job done. Only if it were to become the framework within which more general movements that were under way -- movements with more direct political relevance -- were going on, only then would it have the chance to take the place in American political life that it ought to....But to do so, they (educators and educational institutions) are going to have to get into trouble. For publics that really want to know the realities of their communities and nation and world are, by that determining fact, politically radical. Politics as we know it today often rests upon myths and lies and crackpot notions; and many policies, debated and undebated, assume inadequate and misleading definitions of reality. When such myth and hokum prevail, those who are out to find the truth are bound to be upsetting. This is the role of mind, of intellect, of reason, of ideas: to define reality adequately and in a publicly relevant way. The role of education, especially of education for adults, is to build and sustain publics that will 'go for,' and develop, and live with, and act upon, adequate definitions of reality."

- (125) Mills, C. Wright. The Power Elite. New York: Oxford University Press, 1956. 423 pp. "When crises are defined as total, and as seemingly permanent, the consequences of decision become total, and the decisions in each major area of life come to be integrated and total. Up to a point, these consequences for other institutional orders can be assessed; beyond such points, chances have to be taken. It is then that the felt scarcity of trained and imaginative judgment leads to plaintive feelings among executives about the shortage of qualified successors in political, military, and economic life. This feeling, in turn, leads to an increasing concern with the training of successors who could take over as older men of power retire. In each area, there slowly arises a new generation which has grown up in an age of co-ordinated decisions....What is lacking is a truly common elite program of recruitment and training; for the prep school, Ivy League College, and law school sequence of the metropolitan 400 is not up to the demands now made upon members of the power elite. Britishers, such as Field Marshall Viscount Montgomery, well aware of this lack, recently urged (in a speech at Columbia University) the adoption of a system 'under which a minority of high-caliber young students could be separated from the mediocre and given the best education possible to supply the country with leadership.' His proposal is echoed, in various forms, by many who accept his criticism of 'the American theory of public education on the ground that it is ill-suited to produce the "elite" group of leaders....this country needs to fulfill its obligations of world leadership.' In part these demands

reflect the unstated need to transcend recruitment on the sole basis of economic success, especially since it is suspect as often involving the higher immorality; in part it reflects the stated need to have men who, as Viscount Montgomery says, know 'the meaning of discipline.' But above all these demands reflect the at least vague consciousness on the part of the power elite themselves that the age of co-ordinated decisions, entailing a newly enormous range of consequences, requires a power elite that is of a new caliber. Insofar as the sweep of matters which go into the making of decisions is vast and inter-related, the information needed for judgments complex and requiring particularized knowledge, the men in charge will not only call upon one another; they will try to train their successors for the work at hand. These new men will grow up as men of power within the co-ordination of economic and political and military decision."

- (126) "Nationwide Party Line," Time, (Jan. 11, 1971), pp. 35-36. Illich referred to this development in his Toronto talk (Item #32) as an example of the networks he is calling for which might be appropriate for a certain group of people at a certain level. "TeleSessions, an organization that began operations last month....has a straightforward purpose: to bring strangers with similar interests together on a huge party line for information and fun (the group's) and profit (TeleSessions'). To take part in 'discussions you dial into, 'subscribers call TeleSessions' Manhattan number, specify their area of interest and are assigned to one of the groups. At the appointed hour (usually once a week), TeleSessions calls the subscriber to connect him with as few as ten or as many as two dozen other participants. For a fee of \$2 an hour - long-distance participants must call in themselves and also pay long-distance rates - TeleSessions hosts provide a special switchboard, coordinate and schedule each session and make the telephone introductions of each newcomer to the group. They also screen out the cranks, disconnect the obstreperous and occasionally cut in to redirect a faltering discussion. An actual moderator, TeleSessions discovered, is unnecessary....'So the possibilities are unlimited,' says (TeleSessions President Ron) Richards, who optimistically foresees the day when Paris chefs will join in a gourmet-cooks session, when labor negotiators mediate quickly and amenably (hostility seems to evaporate during a group phone discussion) and when brain surgeons or judges or astronomers keep abreast of their field through weekly convocations - all, of course, via TeleSessions."
- (127) Ohliger, John. "Lifelong Learning -- Voluntary or Compulsory," Adult Leadership, (Sept., 1968), p. 124. "Are we seeking a society where adult education, for all intents and purposes, would be as compulsory as is elementary and

secondary education?....It seems to me that adult educators have taken the belief in 'lifelong learning' and, like the little boy, shot an arrow into the air, knowing not where it would fall. Perhaps it is time to stop and take a look at what we are doing to individuals before shooting off any more arrows." (Reprint available without charge by writing to author at address on the last page of this bibliography.)

- (128) Ohliger, John. "Dialogue with Myself," Adult Leadership, (Feb., 1970), p. 250+. (Reprint available without charge by writing to author at address on last page of this bibliography.) "If adult education becomes compulsory it will negate all the principles of learning established in the field so far. Such principles are based on the idea that learning is a voluntary act."
- (129) Ohliger, John. "Adult Education: 1984," Adult Leadership, January 1971. (A reprint is available without charge by writing to John Ohliger at the address on the last page of this bibliography. A longer discussion draft of an article which contains this material may also be available.) "A child is born in the United States in the year 1984. He can never look forward to getting out of school. From the 'infant school' he starts attending at the age of six months to the 'geriatric learning center' he dies in, he finds himself going to school all his life 'for the good of society.'....When he does die, a minister eulogizes him over his grave....He points out that this man was very lucky, for he was born in 1984, the first year that the national 'Permanent School Law' was in effect. The minister extols the wisdom of the late President Spiro Agnew, who in the last year of his second term of office was able to get such a great law passed. 'And so we bid goodbye to this lucky man,' the minister chants, 'firm in the conviction that he will go to heaven where he will attend a "school for angels" into infinity.' "
- (130) Ozmon, Howard. Editor. Utopias and Education. Minneapolis, Minnesota: Burgess Publishing Company, 1969. 157 pp. (Paperbound edition available from the Burgess Publishing Company, 426 South Sixth Street, Minneapolis, Minnesota 55415). Contains educational utopian writings of Plato, Wells, Huxley, Skinner and nine others. From the introduction: "Messages in utopias are not always clear. There has been a great deal of confusion, in many cases, about just what message an author intended to convey. All of the messages seem clear on the point, however, that there was something wrong, either in whole or in part, with the values which the author found within the society of which he was a member, and his utopian work stands as testimony of his effort to attack these values, and in most instances,

to propose something better to take their place....It is the belief of many utopians that some of the things which we consider evils are really a part of the very institutions to which we swear allegiance, and that, therefore, we cannot hope to eradicate these evils without a corresponding change in those same institutions....At this particular period in history, when man seems engaged in a frenetic search for new national goals, and correspondingly, new educational goals, we would do well to turn again to some of our utopian writers in order to benefit from their thinking upon this subject. There have been thinkers in all ages who have told us that we needed new purposes and new technological and social improvements, but very few of these critics have stated specifically what form these new improvements should take. Our utopians, however, have dared to accept this challenge. They not only say, for example, that education needs to be made better, but they show us what it is like, from their point of view, when it is made better."

- (131) Parker, Edwin B. "Democracy and Information Processing," Educom. Vol. 5, No. 4, (Fall 1970), pp. 2-6. "The accessibility of a 'conversational' information utility medium is likely to facilitate much information gathering of the 'interpersonal' type. For example, many working class or unemployed persons are reluctant to attend evening classes or other adult education classes because they perceive such classes as middle class institutions in which they would feel uncomfortable. Few of these social inhibitors to information seeking would be present in the computer information utility....Thus, it is possible to paint a very rosy picture of the advantages for society if every member of the society has the economic resources to obtain access to such an information utility from earliest childhood....It would be naive to think that the social advantages we have sketched in this article will naturally follow from the development of the technology that makes such a system possible....The costs of extending computer-aided instruction capability to information services generally, and of making it available to everyone in the society, are likely to rival the cost of putting a man on Mars. They may even approach a sizable fraction of the costs of a small war....A more likely result is that the information utilities will be developed primarily from a commercial profit motivation, and that consequently they will serve a segment of the society that has already learned the information-seeking and information-processing skills needed for efficient utilization My suggestion, therefore, is that we begin at once the task of spelling out in detail a technical, economic, and political plan for the creation of public information utilities serving the interest of the entire public. Such detailed plans will be needed before we can successfully

argue for the proportion of the federal budget that will be required. If we can prepare those plans soon enough, we may reach a major milestone in the history of the human species - the first time in which the distribution of a major technological change is planned and directed in the public interest with the likely social consequence taken. The alternative is to proceed the way we always have in the past - and become the victim, rather than the master and beneficiary, of our technology."

- (132) Postman, Neil and Weingartner, Charles. The Soft Revolution. New York: Delacorte Press, 1971. (\$4.95) 183 pp. "Almost any school administrator can testify to the power of parent pressure in the matter of textbook selection. The trouble is that almost all such pressure has come from conservatives. When 'liberal' parents have been involved at all, their role has been largely to defend the status quo. But why? There is almost nothing defensible about school textbooks, and except for some cro-magnons of the Birch Society, the conservatives are right in their basic assumption: Textbooks are biased. Moreover, they are biased, in a way that the conservatives either haven't noticed or don't much care about. Textbooks assume that all students are more or less alike; that students learn in the same way; and that students are interested in the same things. For these reasons, the textbook is responsible, perhaps more than any other single factor, for the rigidity of school curricula. If we can rid ourselves of textbooks, we will open the way to some really creative changes in the curriculum."
- (133) Reich, Charles A. The Greening of America. 201 E. 50th St., New York, New York 10022: Random House, Inc., 1970. 399 pp. \$7.95. (A long portion of this book was originally published in The New Yorker, Vol. XLVI, No. 32, (Sept. 26, 1970), pp. 42-111. "Beginning with school, if not before, an individual is systematically stripped of his imagination, his creativity, his heritage, his dreams, and his personal uniqueness, in order to fit him to be a productive unit in a mass technological society....Our present system has gone beyond anything that could properly be called the creation of capitalism or imperialism or a power elite. That would at least be a human shape. Of course, a power elite does exist, and is made rich by the system, but the members of the elite are no longer in control; they are now merely taking advantage of forces that have a life of their own....Editorials denouncing students, often say that a student who does not like the way a university is run should leave. But society makes it all but mandatory for a young person to complete his education, and in their rules and practices most universities are extraordinarily alike. Moreover, the penalty for many young men who leave is to be drafted. Under these circum-

stances, it is hardly accurate to say that a student has submitted 'voluntarily' to a university's rules....The integration of the corporate state makes inescapable what was formerly voluntary, and powers that once were small and gentle become monstrous and terrifying....The only people who can successfully change an organization or institution are those who already possess power within it -- people who are acting in their capacities as workers or consumers. A schoolteacher, no matter what he thinks or says, cannot change the public-school system while conforming to it by accepting its regulations. But if the teacher changes his behavior as a teacher, ignoring the threat to his personal ambitions that may be a consequence, then change must and will take place. A steadily increasing number of the nation's most idealistic and intelligent young college graduates are going into public-school teaching, and these young people will profoundly change the public-school system despite every effort of the established school bureaucracy to prevent change. They will overpower the school authorities from within, because, being a necessary part of the system, they cannot be prevented from doing so. If the young teachers are willing to accept the consequences of their resistance, they will not be merely voicing opinions -- they will have put their opinions into their working lives....Every evidence suggests that boys and girls in high school, in junior high, and even in grade school are potentially more radical, more deeply committed to a new way of life, than their elders in college."

- (134) Robinson, Sunny. Formation of the Learning Community. 122 pp. 1970. mimeo. (For information on obtaining this document write to Professor Malcolm Knowles, Department of Administration and Supervision, School of Education, Boston University, Boston, Mass.) "What is a Learning Community? To the author, a Learning Community is a collection of people with diverse learning needs who have come together in a less structured, more self-directed way to try out new styles of learning within the context of temporary systems. It is a place and way of working together to serve one's own learning needs as well as those of others around and with you. Thus, activity in such a setting gives also a sense of community (belonging, needing, sharing and being responsible) and not just learning (acquisition of new knowledge and/or behavior)."
- (135) Rogers, Carl R. Freedom to Learn. Columbus, Ohio: Charles E. Merrill Publishing Co., 1969. 358 pp. (Paperback edition available at \$3.95 from Charles E. Merrill Publishing Co., 1300 Alum Creek Dr., Columbus, Ohio 43216). "It does not seem reasonable to impose freedom on anyone who does not desire it. Consequently it seems wise, if

it is at all possible, that when a group is offered the freedom to learn on their own responsibility, there should also be provision for those who do not wish or desire this freedom and prefer to be instructed and guided....Education -- our most conservative institution."

- (136) Roszak, Theodore. The Making of a Counter Culture: Reflections on the Technocratic Society and Its Youthful Opposition. New York: Anchor Books, 1968. 303 pp. (Available in paperback at \$1.95 from Anchor Books c/o Doubleday & Co., Inc., 501 Franklin Ave., Garden City, New York 11531). "We call it 'education,' the 'life of the mind,' the 'pursuit of the truth.' But it is a matter of machine-tooling the young to the needs of our various baroque bureaucracies: corporate, governmental, military, trade union, educational....The universities produce the brains the technocracy needs; therefore, making trouble on the campus is making trouble in one of the economy's vital sectors. And once the graduate students -- many of whom may be serving as low-level teaching assistants -- have been infected with qualms and aggressive discountents, the junior faculty, with whom they overlap, may soon catch the fevers of dissent and find themselves drawn into the orbit of 'youth.'.... The young, miserably educated as they are, bring with them almost nothing but healthy instincts. The project of building a sophisticated framework of thought atop those instincts is rather like trying to graft an oak tree upon a wild flower. How to sustain the oak tree? More important, how to avoid crushing the wildflower? And yet such is the project that confronts those of us who are concerned with radical social change. For the young have become one of the very few social levers dissent has to work with. This is that 'significant soil' in which the Great Refusal has begun to take root. If we reject it in frustration for the youthful follies that also sprout there, where do we turn?"

- (137) Schrag, Peter. "Education's 'Romantic' Critics" Saturday Review (February 18, 1967). "The new critics -- Edgar Z. Friedenberg, Paul Goodman, Jules Henry, John Holt, and others -- are far too independent and cantankerous to develop a consistent voice or anything that could be considered a program, but their common defense of children and adolescents and their fundamental attacks on established practices have given them a place apart from the conventional critics....In many respects the new critics are more interested in the processes of growing up, in learning and experience, than they are in the formalities of educational programs, the design of curricula, or the planning of administrative conveniences....Although the new critics are all teachers, and are all affiliated with American education, they belong to no establishment, not

even to a single kind of institution. Spiritually -- and often physically -- they are itinerants....The passions that followed Sputnik and the college panic divided us between those who wanted to make education a more efficient training instrument for the Cold War and middle-management, and those who resisted because the pace of life adjustment was more comfortable than intellectual rigor. The new critics have reminded us -- sometimes, albeit, with too much wail -- that relevant education has little to do with either, and that if it does not deal with the humanity of its students, it is not dealing with anything."

- (138) Schrag, Peter. "End of the Impossible Dream," Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 38, (Sept. 19, 1970), pp. 68-70+. "The declining faith in educational institutions is threatening the idea of education itself....If the school system is the only mode of access to social and economic salvation, and if there is only one officially honored definition of such salvation (house in the suburbs, job at IBM, life insurance, and a certain set of manners), and if the school excludes any sizable minority from such salvation, then we have obviously defined ourselves into a choice between revolution and repression."
- (139) Sheats, Paul H. "New Knowledge For What?" Adult Leadership, Vol. 11 (Jan., 1963). Sheats, former Dean of University of California Extension and now Professor of Adult Education at UCLA, writes here of his "personal concern with what is happening to the processes of free discussion and debate under the impact of the cold war and accelerated change....This problem of increasing citizen competence and of improving the quality of decision making must, it seems to me, be of central concern to (adult educators).. ..I believe that we have the inventive genius and the capabilities to mount a program which will provide needed information on policy issues before the people and create the kind of communication network through which these informed opinions may influence policy making....The success of efforts in the past and the demonstrated need for improved citizen competence today makes one wonder why the leadership and funds required to mount such a national effort are not now forthcoming. The cost of such a program would be infinitesimal when compared with expenditures either in defense or on the space race. It is difficult to see how an open society can preserve its strength without nurturing and facilitating the free play of ideas in the marketplace. Deeply imbedded in the American creed is the concept of education as the development of the capacity for growth of the individual to the full realization of his potentiality. This creed, expressing as it does, faith in the perfectibility of man and in the possibility that his destiny is still subject to rational control, can be given new vitality by a national program to generate civic com-

petence and public responsibility. Conceivably, we have now within our grasp a new kind of society -- 'a learning society' made up of educative communities in which we can accelerate not only the discovery of new knowledge but its application to the betterment of the human condition. In this view, life is learning, the national dialogue will continue, and the search for truth, hammered out in the crossfire of free discussion and debate, will go forward. To these ends, our joint efforts must be dedicated."

- (140) Silberman, Charles. Crisis in the Classroom: The Remaking of American Education. New York: Random House, 1970. 553 pp. (Order at \$10.00 from Random House, Inc., 201 E. 50th Street, New York, New York 10022). This is the result of the three-and-a-half year, \$300,000 study commissioned by the Carnegie Corporation. Lawrence A. Cremin, Professor of Education at Columbia's Teachers College, chaired the Advisory Commission. "The dean of a liberal arts college in a large Eastern university arranges a short course in teaching methods for his faculty, to be given by senior members of the faculty of the university's graduate school of education. The course confirms all the prejudices the liberal arts professors had had about educationists and adds a few more. At the first session, for example, the educationist -- the ed. school's most distinguished authority on adult education -- tells the assembled faculty that it is important for a teacher to see things from the learner's perspective as well as his own. While he realizes that it may not always be possible for them to do so, he goes on to say, it is nonetheless essential that they try their very best to learn at last one new thing about their subject each year, so that they can recapture, however fleetingly, the learner's perspective. (The second session is devoted in large measure to an exposition of the superiority of yellow chalk vis-a-vis white chalk.)"
- (141) Southern, Albert M. "Dissertation Proposal: Attitude Findings Among Students in University Courses on Adult Education When Given Increased Opportunities for Self-Direction." Dec. 1970. 16 pp. Xeroxed. (For information on availability write to Albert Southern c/o John Ohliger at the address on the last page of the bibliography) "The investigation herein seeks to explore feedback from a group of learners when they are given an opportunity to experience an innovative approach in learning; a learner-helper approach giving more responsibility to the students The goal of this investigation is to explore the differences in attitudes that are measurable in the learners in a course in which additional self-responsibility was given to the students....One group (Experimental Group) will, at the beginning of the course, be told that they will be permitted and expected to actively participate

in planning class activities and to responsibly implement the plans that are made. The other group (Control Group) will use, without option, the same text, reading assignments, term paper assignment, and final examination that had been selected and used in the course for several years previously. The same professor will teach both sections."

- (142) Stone, Lawrence. "The Ninnyversity?" The New York Review of Books. IV, 1, (January 28, 1971). (From a review of Scholars and Gentlemen: Universities and Society in Pre-Industrial Britain, 1500-1700 by H. F. Kearney published by Cornell for \$6.75, 214 pp.) "In any case, even if Professor Kearney's categories were correct, which they are not, his system of polarities is false, since it is not how ideas work. New ideas permeate old ones, run underground and pop up in unexpected places, mingle surreptitiously, or even coexist side by side without either conflict or conflation. One system of beliefs or values rarely challenges another directly and finally overthrows it in a single cataclysmic struggle. It is more a matter of guerrilla warfare, secret infiltration, and eventual mutual accommodation."
- (143) Stretch, Bonnie Barrett. "The Rise of the 'Free School!'" Saturday Review, Vol. LIII, No. 25 (June 29, 1970). "The new schools charge little or no tuition, are frequently held together by spit and string, and run mainly on the energy and excitement of people who have set out to do their own thing. Their variety seems limitless. No two are alike. They range from inner-city black to suburban and rural white. Some seem to be pastoral escapes from the grit of modern conflict while others are deliberate experiments in integrated multi-cultural, multilingual education. They turn up anywhere - in city storefronts, old barns, former barracks, abandoned church buildings, and parents' or teachers' homes. They have crazy names like Someday School, Viewpoint Non-School, A Peck of Gold, The New Community, or New Directions - names that for all their diversity reflect the two things most of these schools have in common: the idea of freedom for youngsters and a humane education....As the Community School of Santa Barbara (California) states in its brochure: 'The idea is a supreme good; that people, including young people, have a right to freedom and that people who are free will in general be more open, more humane, more intelligent than people who are directed, manipulated, ordered about....' " (The article includes a list of several sources of information about free schools and free school publications.)
- (144) Taylor, Warren. "A Review of The Greening of America," by Charles A. Reich. New York: Random House, 1970. 399 pp. \$7.95. AAUP Bulletin. Vol. 57, No. 1 (March 1971). pp. 16-20. "Few informed Americans, for example, could

take serious exception to Reich's conclusion that education in America has, at this date, failed and must be conceived and implemented anew in both substance and practice (pp. 130-137; 358-360). The schools have become 'brutal machines' (p. 137) which train students 'to stop thinking and start obeying' (p. 131). In trying to become junior universities, the undergraduate colleges have failed to develop the perspectives and judgments of whole men and women (pp. 16, 176). This forces production of 'research and publication' in undergraduate colleges and thwarts 'the self-renewal and search for enlightenment that a teacher needs' (p. 176). Reich's remarks on the failure of education throughout his book - whether intentionally or unintentionally does not matter - are echoes from Jefferson. 'If a nation expects to be ignorant and free, in a state of civilization, it expects what never was and never will be.' Jefferson wrote in 1816."

- (145) Theobald, Robert. "Accent on Social Philosophy: Education For a New Era or How to Understand the Need For A Compassionate Revolution," Adult Leadership, Vol. 18, No. 5, (Nov. 1969), p. 148. "It is only the process of discovering whether the assumptions by which we live are truly valid which constitutes education. This process is inductive. It can never be taken over by computers. Rather it requires the imaginative cooperation of all those who are interested. Adult education should be pioneering in the development of this real form of education, the dialogic form of education pioneered by Socrates and periodically rediscovered since. It forms our only hope for the future....But while adult educators should be particularly involved in this form of education, there are many questions as to whether they will be. Adult educators are, in general, liberals and we are just coming to perceive that liberals possess a deeply manipulative philosophy. This new form of education requires a profound respect for the individual's capacity to determine what he needs to know and to create his own direction. The industrial age has led us to treat people as cogs in a machine -- this point is now no longer really controversial. It is now also clear, however, that the continuation of the dehumanization of man will destroy life on earth. The question today is whether adult educators will take part in the required compassionate revolution."
- (146) Theobald, Robert. An Alternative Future for America II: Essays and Speeches. Chicago: The Swallow Press, Inc., 1968. 199 pp. (paperback edition available at \$2.00 from The Swallow Press, Inc., 1139 South Wabash Avenue, Chicago, Illinois 60605.) "If we are to be able to create an educational system valid for the future, we must accept that the area seen as education by the individual will depend on his own purposes. This implies, in turn, that there must be many styles of educational institutes for the many

educational purposes which exist now and for the even wider range which will come into existence as we encourage the diversity made possible by the new technologies." The book ends with a "Working Appendix" listing "some emerging initiatives relevant to the alternative future envisioned in this book." Among them are the Educational Policy Research Center, the Aspen Seminar for Environmental Arts and Sciences, Human Potential Seminars, the Spaceship Earth Curriculum Project, Vocations for Social Change, St. Mary Center for Learning, The Living-Learning Center at the University of Minnesota, Student Campus Improvement System, Office of Academic Innovation at the University of California, the Radical Research Center at Carleton College, The Whole Earth Catalog, the Dialogue Series of Bobb-Merrill Co., Inc., audio visual materials on implications of the new technologies of the National Council of Churches, Teg's 1994 (see below), the New Schools Exchange, The Teacher Drop-out Center of the University of Massachusetts, the World Future Society, the Ecology Action Educational Institute, the World Game of Buckminster Fuller, "World Ecology Year 1972" of the Growth Centers of North America, the newsservice/newsletter Earth Read-out, the magazine The Teacher Paper, and The Environmental Handbook. Information on these and on additional programs and materials is available in a packet from the Center for Curriculum Design, Box AF, Kendall College, Evanston, Illinois 60204. The cost of this packet, including Dialogue on Education (one of the paperbacks edited by Theobald in the Bobbs-Merrill series) plus placement on the Center's mailing list, is \$5.00.

- (147) Theobald, Robert and J. M. Scott. Teg's 1994: An Anticipation of the Near Future. 114 pages, mimeographed and published in the Fall of 1969. (Available at \$5.00 from Personalized Secretarial Service, 5045 North 12th Street, Phoenix, Arizona 85012.) "Teg's 1994 sketches a possible future world where the techno-system acts merely as infrastructure, expansion and growth are no longer goals and human society has reemphasized social interaction through worldwide decentralization into small, sub-cultural communities." The authors seek to engage the reader in a dialogue about this "participation book."
- (148) Tollett, Kenneth and William Ewald, Rexford Tugwell, Robert M. Hutchins, John Wilkinson, Mark Triebnasser, Harry S. Ashmore, Piers von Simson, and James Wood. Adolescence Is No Time for School. Audio-tape. 28 minutes, 58 seconds. (Order as Tape #510 for \$7.50 from The Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, P.O. Box 4446, Santa Barbara, California 93103. Available either on five-inch 3 3/4 i.p.s. half track tapes or on cassettes. Free study guide available with tape on request.) Kenneth Tollett, Dean of the Law School of Texas Southern University: "The

university must make greater allowances for integrating the emotions and the intellect." Robert M. Hutchins, Chairman, Fund for the Republic: "Nicholas Murray Butler (late president, Columbia University) and Will Ogburn (late sociologist) both said almost simultaneously fifty years ago that the explosion of information was such that we were going to have to prolong adolescence at least until age forty-five in order to get it all into our students." John Wilkinson, philosopher and physicist: "One could contest this idea that there has been this explosion of information. In fact, most of the scientists who were here at the Center (for the Study of Democratic Institutions) for the ecology conference were of the impression that there hadn't been an explosion of information, there had been an explosion of data....There has been a great deal of simplification. Astronomers can now operate with a few equations....We can learn a hell of a lot more than anybody in the past with very little effort if we have got the right kind of preparation." Hutchins: "The whole point of the Danish Folk High School is the idea that you get enough education so that you're not a danger to yourself and society and then you have some time to mature before you come back and go at it again. The Danish Folk High School, which has spread all over Scandinavia, is an adult educational institution. It is entirely devoted to non-vocational subjects....Maybe, as part of the general move toward de-institutionalization, that I think we're in for in education, we ought to think about the university in a different way."

- (149) Toffler, Alvin. Future Shock. 201 E. 50th St., New York, New York 10022: Random House, Inc., 1970. 505 pp. \$8.95. "Earnest intellectuals talk bravely about 'educating for change' or 'preparing people for the future.' But we know virtually nothing about how to do it....In all the talk about the need for continuing education, in all the popular discussions of retraining, there is an assumption that man's potentials for re-education are unlimited. This is, at best, an assumption, not a fact, and it is an assumption that needs close and scientific scrutiny.... We shall watch the irresistible growth of companies already in the experiential field, and the formation of entirely new enterprises, both profit and non-profit, to design, package and distribute planned or programmed experiences....Education, already exploding in size, will become one of the key experience industries as it begins to employ experiential techniques to convey both knowledge and values to students....Long before the year 2000, the entire antiquated structure of degrees, majors, and credits will be a shambles. No two students will move along exactly the same educational track. For the students now pressuring higher education to destandardize, to move toward super-industrial diversity, will win the battle..

..Failure to diversify education within the system will simply lead to the growth of alternative opportunities outside the system."

- (150) Tough, Allen M. Learning Without a Teacher: A Study of Tasks and Assistance During Adult Self-teaching Projects. Educational Research Series No. 3. Toronto 5, Ontario, Canada: PUBLICATIONS, The Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, 252 Bloor Street West, 1967. 92 pp. \$1.75. (Also a brief outline of research in progress in this area is available by writing to Allen Tough, Department of Adult Education, OISE.) "The data clearly support a major hypothesis in the study; namely, that self-teachers can and do perform several of the tasks of a professional teacher....The amount of assistance received by the self-teachers was very great....Although the effectiveness of self-teaching was not studied, it became evident during the interviews that many adults who decide to teach themselves some large and difficult body of knowledge and skills do so quite successfully....Perhaps the ultimate question to be tackled by future research into self-teaching is this: how can professional educators improve the quality and scope of the subject matter and the effectiveness of the methodology in self-teaching?"
- (151) "Trading Stamps Lure Youngsters to School," Columbus Citizen-Journal, Columbus, Ohio. Monday, February 8, 1971. "OAKLAND, Calif. (UPI) - Officials at McClymonds High School will soon be giving trading stamps to students with perfect attendance records. 'Our culture is trading-stamp oriented,' says Vice Principal Ralph Griffin, 'It is sure to work.' Students will be given 45 a day plus monthly bonus stamps. The stamp incentive was one of the number of ideas proposed within the Oakland School System which are being funded with special grants."
- (152) U.S. Congress: H.R. 33. "In The House Of Representatives, (January 22, 1971), Mr. Brademas (for himself, Mr. Reid of New York, Mr. Perkins, and Mr. Quie) introduced the following bill; which was referred to the Committee on Education and Labor..." "A BILL To establish a National Institute of Education, and for other purposes....The Congress hereby declares it to be the policy of the United States to provide equality of educational opportunity to all persons regardless of race, color, religion, sex, national origin, or social class. Although the American educational system has pursued this objective, it has not attained it. Inequalities of opportunity remain pronounced. To achieve equality will require far more dependable knowledge about the processes of learning and education than now exists or can be expected from present research and experimentation in this field."

- (153) Van den Berghe, Pierre. Academic Gamesmanship. New York: Abelard-Schuman Limited, 1970. 116 pp. \$4.95. "The Ivory Tower is unquestionable the most pleasant microcosm in American society. Fortunately for its academic fauna, few of the other subspecies of Homo sapiens know it. And the reason for this widespread ignorance is not accidental. Like all privileged guilds, academics restrict entry into their group and wrap themselves in shrouds of protective secrecy. The first and the most important line of defense against the massive intrusion of outsiders is a set of elaborate and highly successful myths about the nature of academic life. Briefly, there are three principal myths: 1) An academic career requires superior ability. 2) The rewards, especially the material rewards, of academic life are meager. 3) Academic life is dull."
- (154) Whipple, James; Haygood, Kenneth; Goldman, Freda H.; and Siegle, Peter. Liberal Education Reconsidered. Syracuse, New York: Syracuse University Press, 1969. 114 pp. \$2.50. Siegle: "An important key to understanding liberal education in the context of the Einsteinian world is to recognize that it is not fixed but is rather on-going education conceived as basic and continuing at the same time. The real challenge, then, is to find the way of reconciling basic and continuing education. One of the difficulties we face is the fact that in our current and traditional mode of thought, basic education tends to be skill-oriented and thing-oriented rather than oriented to personal qualities. The way to reconcile the two is to redefine what is basic to the continuing development of the individual, to find what represents continuity in the individual life....If liberal education is both basic and continuing, then the difference between the education of children and the education of adults becomes blurred, and we are geared to an unbroken line of development. There is a constant and continuing flow of learnings building up and being reinforced from childhood through adulthood. What is learned in childhood can facilitate and inhibit further learning in adulthood. Thus, liberal education means that we must look at those characteristics that enable man to feel comfortable in an open system, comfortable with ambiguity, and secure in his ability to cope with it; he must know that even though he comes to a conclusion for the moment, it is a tentative conclusion."
- (155) Wills, Garry. Nixon Agonistes: The Crisis of the Self-Made Man. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Co., 2 Park Street, Boston, Massachusetts 02107, 617 pp. \$10.00. "The academic market is based on the pretense that real intellectual neutrality toward ideas can be maintained; that ideas will, of themselves, join, struggle, clash in the blank arena of the mind. The liberal intellect should

first be a mere observer, detached and impartial ('may the best idea win'), so that it may finally be the arbiter, raising the glove of the victorious idea. Yet it is only the mind that can conceive ideas, be their vehicle, urge them, reject them. Ideas will not carry themselves into battle, act by some inner energy upon the passive observing mind. The picture of the mind as somehow above ideas, arbitrating over them, is one of the attempts to find a mechanism in nature that will yet be above it, an invisible hand 'self-regulating.' Thus truth is said to reside in the mind's openness toward ideas, yet also in the ideas that prevail; and the mind gets from its first impartial stance to its later acceptance without ever being quite responsible for the outcome. It was not an advocate of the winning idea at the outset, but a judge, finally, of the outcome -- which leaves the ideas without any original advocates....Under challenge, academicians retreat to their basic doctrine -- still unaware that this intellectual 'market' is as rickety with pretense as the economic one. Yet students, tortured by the contradictions involved in campus war work, are probing to more basic inconsistencies. For instance: (1) A truly value-free openness toward ideas does not, and cannot, exist in the academy, for several reasons. One of them is theoretical: certain ideas cannot be entertained, at least not seriously, because they would of their nature 'close the market.' Totalist systems, therefore -- revealed religions, philosophies that proclaim an absolute truth, political systems (whether fascist or communist) that proscribe certain kinds of opinion -- cannot in theory be advocated at public schools....(2) Aside from this theoretical limit to openness, there is a practical limit. It is impossible to get up every morning and rebuild one's conceptual world ex nihilo, to achieve an Emersonian mental rebirth every day. One necessarily assumes a great deal, working with what one believes to be the best assumptions which are the actual framework of one's thinking. Beyond this personal set of ruling assumptions, there is the need to talk with others, to focus research, to finish an eight-week project with one's colleague....All this is normal enough; indeed, it would be impossible to get any work done if such practical exclusions did not take place. What is unsettling to intellectual honesty is the pretense (e.g. in the University of California Handbook), that such inhibition, such fostering of orthodoxies, does not take place, that the play of ideas is entirely free....(3) Although the system claims to be value-free, a loose orthodoxy exists in each area of modern study, an orthodoxy made up of the Propositions X that are favored by leaders of the profession. And it is precisely the claim of objectivity and openness that narrows the range of questions that can be asked about Proposition X -- e.g., it cannot be challenged from 'absolutist' directions. In fact, the more

technical, minute, and 'objective' study becomes, the more does it stand in need of an embracing, unquestioned Proposition X: to study in detail the minnow, and be rated on one's results, one needs a firm aquatic category within which, vicariously, to swim with one's subject, and send melodious, measurable bubbles up the exposed aquarium side. One not only narrows one's assumptions, structures one's professional world of exploration, but does this in order to make the assumptions procedurally unquestionable. (4) Measuring the bubbles becomes all-important to the academician's career. The pretense that there is no orthodoxy means that a teacher is supposedly judged only by his competence in his field. Thus 'absolutists' or holders of Non-X, must be found to be, not wrong, but 'incompetent.' And teachers who are socially or politically unacceptable to their fellows cannot be dismissed on such grounds (often reasonable), but must also be declared incompetent....(5) The result is that few, if any, men in America live so entirely on their professional reputations as do academicians, guard that reputation jealously, rate it against others' with such regularity....Thus, in a world consecrated to the disinterested search for truth, envy and petty competitiveness thrive....(6) The egalitarian side of the academy was, in principle, intellectual rather than social -- openness gave each idea an equal chance, academic freedom gave each teacher the right to follow his research to any conclusion, and purity of research was guaranteed by the determination to impose no orthodoxy.. ..Thus there was equality in the sphere of ideas, and (by extension) among those 'dissecting' the ideas; but this equality did not extend to students. The relation of teacher to student was semiparental and authoritarian. The student, who comes to an institute to learn, proclaims by that very act that he does not know; the teacher is accredited as one who does know; and the process of teaching was to be one of transferring measurable amounts of knowledge from the clearly labeled possessor of that knowledge to one just as clearly labeled as deficient in it....Yet the real solvent of the teacher-student relationship is the fundamental doctrine of the academy, the free play of ideas. For if any idea is to be given equal hearing, then any idea's advocate must be given equal hearing. After all, how do we know the professor knows more than the student, once the student 'dissents' -- i.e. expresses a different idea? That question, too, must be kept 'open,' not solved a priori; solved only by dialogue -- and dialogue is conducted by equals. Thus the parent-child, or patron-client relationship was always at war with an equal-to-equal relationship forced on the unwilling faculty by that faculty's own first principles. (7) The faculty's means of reasserting authority in this situation is to declare the student's opinion, not false,

but incompetent. (8) The result of all this is what Marcuse identified (but clumsily analyzed) as 'repressive tolerance.' That is, a situation exists wherein a covert set of values (whether true or not, good or not, is beside the point) is defended while official pretense is made of being 'neutral' toward the masked values. And since there is (by the official myth) no orthodoxy, no specific provision has to be made for dissent from the orthodoxy. Dissent is supposed to be the orthodoxy -- though that is far from true. What is left, then, of Schlesinger's claim that students are in rebellion against society, not against the university? The university has been intertwined with our society from the outset, a servant to its political ideals, a partner in its procedures. In fact, the university concentrates and throws into relief the inconsistencies of society, makes them particularly striking because of the academy's claim to a superior standard of intellectual purity and consistency of behavior. Thus Paul Jacobs and Saul Landau concluded, in The New Radicals, that student rebellion began at Berkeley because of that school's liberalism, not despite it."

- (156) Wofford, Harris, Jr., editor. Embers of the World: Conversations with Scott Buchanan. P.O. Box 4068, Santa Barbara, California 93103: The Center for the Study of Democratic Institutions, 1970. 259 pp. \$2.25. Paperback. Buchanan: "I think teaching is primarily the business of listening to the pupil and responding to whatever happens in the pupil with further questions, and it could be the questions are statements. I mean statements are questions if you understand them properly -- they're proposals to entertain something. A statement is saying, 'Well, what do you think of this?' Then when you hear what they think of this, you try some more. Jacques Maritain's book on education is one of the best statements I've heard about what a teacher does in this respect. He thinks of a teacher as knowing more than the pupil does, yet in some sense not conveying it but seeing that it is made available to the pupil. The great use of superior knowledge is to understand what the pupil is learning as it is learned. It takes great wisdom to be able to follow a learning pupil sensitively enough to know what the next step is for him, and you don't press the next step. You watch it happen. If it sticks, you help it a bit, but it's not a transmission or an imposition or a filling of a vessel or any of those things. Those are all bad images of the real teaching function: the real one is this penetration of the intelligence, of one intelligence into another." Wofford: "Do you put the Socratic seminar at the center of your vision of an educating community?....Can a republic ever really be a learning community in that sense? Can a community of learning be republican?"....Buchanan: The

American republic was a real republic until the Civil War when it contradicted itself and fell to pieces for the time being, and it hasn't really recovered since in the political sense." Wofford: "You can see Lincoln as the most Socratic person in American history?" Buchanan: "I think that's true. He had a lot of traits that are not Socratic in the obvious sense, but there is this: he was a brooder. This is the word used about him so much. He was listening in a curious way to what was going on throughout the community -- kind of a brooding presence over the whole thing. People forget this side of Socrates. They think of him as a noisy questioner, but if the Platonic picture is at all correct, Socrates was a great listener, a better listener than a talker. His responses to what his opponents said show this. He was brooding over things. This is a good description of good teaching: brooding, almost in the literal sense, the way a hen broods over her chickens."

- (157) For information about securing an audio-tape of a conversation between Ivan Illich and Carl Eilenberg of station WNYC - TV, 1969, write to Publications in Continuing Education, 105 Roney Lane, Syracuse, New York 13210.

CONCLUDING STATEMENT:

Grateful acknowledgment is extended to Braxton Tewart, Charles Brown, Mary Vogel, David Williams, Cam Stomberg, Anne Hartung, Tim Leonard, Richard Dodd, and Douglas Smith for their help and suggestions in preparing this bibliography. Help in locating items in this bibliography may be obtained by writing to John Ohliger, Associate Professor of Adult Education, 363 Arps Hall, 1945 N. High Street, Ohio State University, Columbus, Ohio 43210. Suggestions for additions to this bibliography are solicited.